

ANGUS COUNCIL

CHILDREN AND LEARNING COMMITTEE – 7 NOVEMBER 2017

**RESULTS OF CONSULTATION ON PROPOSAL TO DEVELOP A SHARED CAMPUS FOR
HAYSHEAD AND ST THOMAS PRIMARY SCHOOLS**

REPORT BY MARK ARMSTRONG, STRATEGIC DIRECTOR – PEOPLE

ABSTRACT

This report provides a summary of the consultation outcome in relation to the proposal to create a shared campus incorporating Hayshead Primary School and St Thomas Primary School. The report proposes that we proceed to develop a shared campus for these schools.

1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Children and Learning Committee:

- (i) approves the development of a shared campus accommodating Hayshead Primary School and St Thomas Primary School.

2. ALIGNMENT TO THE ANGUS LOCAL OUTCOMES IMPROVEMENT PLAN

This report contributes to the following local outcomes contained within the Angus Local Outcomes Improvement Plan 2017-2030:

- 4 The best start in life for children
- 6 Improved physical, mental and emotional health and well-being
- 9 Safe, secure, vibrant and sustainable communities

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Reference is made to Report 346/16, recommendation (ii), approved by the Children and Learning Committee at its meeting of 20 September 2016. This authorised the formal consultation in relation to developing a shared campus for Hayshead and St Thomas primary schools.

3.2 Reference is made to Report 317/17, approved by the Children and Learning Committee at its meeting of 19 September 2017. This outlined the current funding arrangements to support the replacement of Hayshead Primary School, in addition to Ladyloan and Muirfield Primary Schools.

4. CURRENT POSITION

4.1 Angus Council undertook a formal consultation from 10 May 2017 until 23 June 2017. The consultation was in accordance with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010. The proposal is to create a shared campus facility on the site of Hayshead Primary School accommodating:

- Hayshead Primary School
- St Thomas RC Primary School
- an Early Years facility.

During the period a number of consultation events were held including: Children's consultation events; Staff consultation events; Public consultation events; and online consultation. Across the consultation period a total of 639 responses were received.

- 4.2 Children's Consultation – Generally the children from both schools (63% at Hayshead and 80% at St Thomas) were in favour of a shared campus. The children identified opportunities to: create new friendships; have better and bigger resources; and the potential for new clubs as a result of a shared campus.

The children who were in favour of the schools remaining on separate sites (28% at Hayshead and 12% at St Thomas) expressed concerns over: the need to share some resources; a greater likelihood for bullying; and the preference to remain in a small school.

There were a relatively small amount of children (9% at Hayshead and 8% at St Thomas) who had no preference or were not yet sure.

- 4.3 Staff Consultation – At Hayshead Primary School, 12 (34%) were in favour of a shared campus, 2 (6%) were in favour of the schools remaining on separate sites, and 21 (60%) had no preference. It was acknowledged that Hayshead would receive a new school building regardless of the outcome of the consultation.

At St Thomas, 5 (50%) were in favour of a shared campus, 4 (40%) were in favour of the schools remaining on separate sites. One staff member did not respond (10%).

- 4.4 Following the consultation period and as part of an Education Scotland Focus Group, the St Thomas teachers have identified they are all in support of staying on a separate site. Concerns raised included loss of school identity and its future viability together with transition arrangements between early years and P1. The Head Teacher, Depute Head Teacher and support staff were not part of the Education Scotland Focus Group.

- 4.5 Hayshead Public Event – A public event on 30 May 2017 at Hayshead Primary School resulted in the completion of 19 questionnaires. Of these, 12 (63%) were in favour of a shared campus, four (21%) supported retaining separate schools and three (16%) gave no preference.

- 4.6 St Thomas Public Event and Sports Day – A public event on 31 May 2017 at St Thomas led to 15 questionnaires being returned. Of these, three (20%) were in favour of a shared campus, 11 (73%) supported retaining separate schools and one (7%) expressed no preference.

- 4.7 At the St Thomas Barbecue and Sports Day on 13 June 2017, a further 19 questionnaires were returned. Of these, 12 (63%) were in favour of a shared campus, six (32%) supported retaining separate schools and one (5%) expressed no preference. A number of issues were raised. These included how the individual identity of St Thomas would be retained within a shared campus and how shared areas would be managed.

- 4.8 Taking account of the two St Thomas' events there was a total of 34 responses. Of these 15 (44%) were in favour of a shared campus, 17 (50%) supported retaining separate schools and two (6%) expressed no preference

- 4.9 Online and Written Submissions – The council received 64 online and four written responses from a range of interested stakeholders including the Diocese of Dunkeld. The majority of these responses (46) expressed opposition to the proposal. Key concerns raised included the future independence of St Thomas, potential loss of its Catholic ethos/identity, and its ability to maintain its traditions within a larger campus.

- 4.10 In accordance with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010, the council collated all of the responses made during the consultation and issued a report to Education Scotland on 27 July 2017.

- 4.11 Education Scotland Response – Following a review with children, staff, and parents of both schools, Education Scotland has provided Angus Council with a report. It is their view that the proposal has clear educational benefits for children who may attend the campus in the future.

- 4.12 It is noted that not all the stakeholders engaged in the consultation are supportive of the proposal. It is recommended that the council needs to clearly set out how it intends to engage with key stakeholders such as: - the Diocese of Dunkeld; parent representatives; and teaching

staff from St Thomas, to address concerns raised. The council also needs to clarify what arrangements it will put in place to retain the ethos and identify of each school and how to manage the shared facilities.

- 4.13 Prior to the publication of the consultation report, further engagement has been undertaken with representatives from the Diocese of Dunkeld and the Church Education Representative. A second formal response has now been received from the Bishop of Dunkeld. The letter states:

“... it became clear that a better option for the future needs of our Catholic children in Arbroath was to positively embrace the proposition of a shared campus with Hayshead Primary. This was on the proviso that certain assurances were given on the following points:

That the guidelines issued by the Bishops’ Conference of Scotland on shared campuses be adhered to wherever possible, and in particular:

- 1 That on entering the main foyer of the campus, St Thomas’ School be clearly identified.*
- 2 That St Thomas’ School should by its layout be clearly recognised as a distinct entity within the campus with the freedom to function as a Catholic School.*
- 3 That reasonable provision be made for possible expansion.*
- 4 That provision for a prayer/ reflection space be made available, primarily for St. Thomas, but also to the possible benefit of the campus as a whole.*
- 5 That as much creativity as possible be employed in the provision of all aspects of this campus.*

- 4.14 In accordance with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010, the council published the Consultation Report on Monday 09 October 2017. The report was published on the council website and hard copies were available at both schools together with Angus House, Arbroath Library and Arbroath Access Office. Any consultees who provided an email address were issued a link directly to the consultation report. This ensured the report was available a minimum of 3 weeks before the final decision which this report considers. The report is available [here](#).

5. PROPOSALS / NEXT STEPS

- 5.1 As stated within the Education Scotland Report and highlighted within 4.12 above, further engagement will be required to ensure successful development of the shared campus. The proposed initial engagement will take the form of workshop events with: staff; school management team; pupil representatives; parent councils; and the Diocese of Dunkeld. These will be joint events involving stakeholders from both schools. The workshops will be designed to: - address concerns raised as part of the consultation; develop how the ethos of each school will be retained and developed; and identify how the shared facility could be managed and operated to promote equality between the schools. These initial workshops would be concluded by the end of November 2017 to allow any updated accommodation schedules and design requirements to be agreed.
- 5.2 Revised sketch proposals will be developed by the project architects to reflect the revised requirements. These revised designs will be used within a non-statutory consultation programme of events which will include children, staff and the school community. This consultation will also form part of the major planning application process.
- 5.3 It is recognised that the initial consultation workshops will inform the design development. Joint consultation and engagement with the schools will continue throughout the projects development.
- 5.4 The outline dates for key steps are:
- November 2017: Design consultation.
 - December 2017: Update sketch designs.

- January – August 2018: Detailed Design and pricing
- September 2018 – October 2019: Construction Phase 1
- November 2019 – April 2020: Phase 2 including demolition and landscaping

6. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

6.1 The Scottish Government (SG) is providing a 50% contribution to this phase of the Arbroath Primary Schools Project, totalling £14.6 million. This phase includes the replacement of Ladyloan and Muirfield in addition to Hayshead Primary School. There is no support from SG for the inclusion of St Thomas RC Primary School within a shared campus.

6.2 The current overall project financial breakdown, as outlined within Report 317/17 is as follows:-

Ladyloan	£8.8m
Muirfield	£8.6m
Hayshead	£11.8m
TOTAL	£29.2m

6.3 The above costs include construction costs; fees; decant costs; new furniture and equipment; and a contingency/risk allowance. The costs for Hayshead are based on an area schedule only at this stage.

6.4 The additional cost to include St Thomas RC Primary School within the shared campus is estimated to be up to £2.7million. This is based on an area allowance and Scottish Government cost metrics only. If the shared campus is progressed the additional funding will require to be fully met by the council.

6.5 The additional costs for the inclusion of St Thomas within a shared campus could be funded from:-

Funding source	Value (£ million)
Sale of St Thomas Site	0.2
Early Years expansion	1.0
Future Years Capital identified for St Thomas Refurbishment	1.0
Design efficiencies/rephasing of capital plan	0.5
TOTAL	2.7

6.6 As noted within 6.4 above, the additional costs for St Thomas are based on Scottish Government Cost Metrics only. The brief and design requirements for the building will look to maximise efficiency to minimise any additional funding required from the capital plan.

7. OTHER IMPLICATIONS

Risks

7.1 Opposition to the shared campus may result in a request for the consultation to be 'called in'. In terms of the Schools (Consultation) Scotland Act 2010 the Scottish Ministers may issue a call in notice only if it appears to the Scottish ministers that the education authority may have failed to take proper account of a material consideration relevant to its decision to implement the proposal.

7.2 Section 22D of the Education (Scotland) Act 1980 makes provision for changes to denominational schools (i.e. St Thomas). This applies where there is a proposal that a denominational school is discontinued, amalgamated in whole or in part with another school, the site of such a school is changed, the arrangements for admission are changed or a decision is taken to manage the school as a non – denominational school. If implementation

of the proposal is considered to result in a significant deterioration in the provision, distribution, or availability of denominational education for the pupils in the area of the education authority or any other area or areas combined, compared with the provision, distribution or availability in other public schools and there is no agreement to implementation from the church or denominational body, the Scottish Ministers are bound to take certain action and their consent may be required.

- 7.3 The additional consultation/engagement required to address the concerns raised will likely extend the project programme.
- 7.4 Current St Thomas teaching staff are no longer in favour of the proposal this may not be changed by the additional engagement outlined.
- 7.5 A delay to the programme may receive a negative reaction from Hayshead staff and community due to the requirement for additional engagement to progress the shared campus.
- 7.6 The building has to be complete and occupied by March 2020 to meet the requirements of SFT funding. Any delay begins to put this date at risk.
- 7.7 Any delay could increase costs due to inflation.

Equalities Impact Assessment

- 7.8 An Equalities Impact Assessment has been completed. There are no adverse impacts from this proposal.

NOTE: The background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) which were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above report are:

- Report 346/16, Children and Learning Committee, 20 September 2016
- Report 317/17, Children and Learning Committee, 19 September 2017

REPORT AUTHOR: Les Hutchinson, Head of Corporate Quality & Performance
EMAIL DETAILS: PEOPLE@angus.gov.uk