

**ANGUS COUNCIL**

**COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE – 14 November 2017**

**SUPPLY OF POST EXCAVATION ARCHAEOLOGICAL SERVICES, BALMACHIE ROAD  
DEVELOPMENT, CARNOUSTIE – TENDER REPORT**

**REPORT BY STRATEGIC DIRECTOR - PLACE**

**ABSTRACT**

Report on tenders received and recommendation of acceptance where the lowest acceptable tender exceeds the Chief Officer's procurement delegated authority limits

**1. RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that the Committee:

- (i) approves the acceptance of the lowest acceptable tender for Archaeological Services in relation to the development of two sports pitches with associated drainage, parking and fencing at Balmachie Road, Carnoustie, from GUARD Archaeology Ltd in the amount of £84,930.
- (ii) approves the estimated total cost of £86,630 inclusive of professional fees.
- (iii) approves the production of replica items from the Bronze Age hoard and a scaled reconstruction model of the site for public display and educational purposes for the total cost of £2,670.
- (iv) notes the net cost of £38,000 will be fully funded from current year revenue underspend
- (v) notes the financial implications included in Section 6 of this report

**2. ALIGNMENT TO THE ANGUS COMMUNITY PLAN/SINGLE OUTCOME AGREEMENT/COPORATE PLAN**

This report contributes to the following local outcomes contained within the Angus Community Plan and Single Outcome Agreement 2013-2016:

- Our communities are developed in a sustainable manner
- Our natural and built environment is protected and enjoyed
- Our communities are safe, secure and vibrant

**3. BACKGROUND**

- 3.1 Reference is made to Report 26/15 whereby approval was granted to undertake the development of two outdoor grass pitches on land purchased under a section 75 agreement at Newton Farm in Carnoustie. A planning application was submitted and approved subject to conditions, one of which was to carry out a programme of archaeological research ahead of development works.
- 3.2 The archaeological excavation works which were approved by the Communities Committee on the 17 January 2017 (Report No 28/17) were completed by April 2017 and the archaeological features and finds are now to undergo the required post-excavation analysis, research and conservation in order to satisfy Condition 3 of the Planning Permission reference 15/00117/FULM for the development of two sports pitches.

- 3.3 Aberdeenshire Council Archaeology Service (ACAS) who act as archaeological advisers to Angus Council under a Service Level Agreement had agreed to the start of construction work of the two sports pitches provided that Angus Council undertook to carry out the post-excavation analysis as per the Post-Excavation Research Design (PERD) recommendations. This was agreed in January 2017 by Communities Committee (Report 28/17 refers). Consequently works started in March on the construction of 2 grass football pitches, associated fencing, car park, access road and landscaping and were completed in June 2017. The grass pitches are being maintained by the contractor until June 2018 when their management will be transferred to the Carnoustie Panmure Football Club (SCIO) under a proposed lease agreement.

#### **4. CURRENT POSITION**

- 4.1 As required the archaeological contractor carrying out the excavation works has produced a PERD, which sets out a programme of specialist analyses, conservation, publication and final archiving of the results of the hand excavations. These post-excavation works comprise the final stage of archaeological works associated with the planning application for the development of grass pitches at Balmachie Road, Carnoustie.
- 4.2 During the excavation works a total of 2177 sherds of prehistoric pottery, 561 lithic fragments, 28 coarse stone items/fragments (e.g. saddle and rotary querns, ground stone axe), 15 fragments of burnt bone and other small finds were discovered and documented. These items range in date from the early Neolithic to the late Bronze Age. The finds indicate the existence of several Bronze Age domestic dwellings and what appears to be the remains of a Neolithic long house (4000 – 2500 BC), thought to be the largest in Scotland. The detailed analysis will address the questions of the period of time when these artefacts were in use, how they relate to a local, regional and national context, evaluate changes in the local environment and more.
- 4.3 In addition to the analyses for the main excavation material, a deposit containing Bronze Age metal work, including a sword, spear and other associated items, was also discovered. With the finding of the hoard what was already a locally and nationally archaeologically significant site became internationally significant. Due to the sensitivity of these remains, in particular the surviving organic elements, a post-excavation programme was commissioned by Angus Council in January 2017 and is ongoing as a separate, albeit related programme of work. The finds of this analysis will be incorporated into the final publication report.

#### **5. TENDER FOR ARCHAEOLOGICAL POSTS EXCAVATION SERVICES**

- 5.1 Tender documents were issued for the supply of post excavation archaeological services using the open tendering procedure through the Public Contracts Scotland (PCS) website portal. The tenders were lodged electronically on the PCS portal on Friday 29 September 2017.
- 5.2 Tenderers were evaluated on a price/quality basis to ascertain the most economically advantageous tender. The overall weighting for evaluation of the tenders was on the basis of a price/quality split between price and financial criteria at 70% and quality criteria at 30%.
- 5.3 The tenders received, and after checking, were as follows:

Contractor	Tender Amount	Amount after Checking
GUARD Archaeology Ltd	£84,925.00	£84,929.88
Wardell Armstrong LLP	£138,691.10	£138,664.56
CFA Archaeology Ltd	£230,175.47	£230,175.74
Headland Archaeology Ltd	£387,566.30	£387,566.90

The results of the price/quality assessment were as follows:

Contractor	Price Score	Quality Score	Overall Score	Ranking
GUARD Archaeology Ltd	70	30	100	1
Wardell Armstrong LLP	43	27	70	2
CFA Archaeology Ltd	26	29	55	3
Headland Archaeology Ltd	15	29	44	4

The estimated total cost of this project, based on the lowest tender and including professional fees is £86,630.

- 5.4 While the remainder of the works are required to satisfy Condition 3 of the Planning Permission reference 15/00117/FULM it has been proposed to manufacture replicas of the Bronze Age hoard and of the site to facilitate public display at different locations in Angus and for educational purposes. The tender asked for costs for the manufacture of a replica of the Bronze Age hoard objects including the sword, spearhead, pin, mount, pommel and chape along with a wooden scabbard and other organic remains at a scale of 1:1. This would enable Angus Council to display the hoard replicas in a public setting without the necessary security and storage complications of displaying the objects themselves. In addition a model reconstruction of the site is proposed that would incorporate the findings of the post excavation analysis and would show the site as it would have looked when the archaeological artefacts were being used in daily life. The cost of preparation of both replicas is £2,670, which is included in the total cost of £86,630, and would support important interpretation and visitor events in Carnoustie and the whole of Angus in the future.

## 6. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 6.1 The approved (gross) budget for the pitch and main archaeological works is £665,000 (as detailed in the updated 2016/2021 Financial Plan - report 261/17 refers), funded from grant of up to £165,000 from sportscotland (in relation to the pitches works) and borrowing of £500,000. It should be noted that the approved borrowing of £500,000 includes an allocation of £300,000 from the corporate capital contingency towards the main archaeological works (as previously agreed by the Policy & Budget Strategy Group).
- 6.2 The projected outturn of the current works (pitches and main archaeological works) can be summarised as follows:

	<u>Approved Budget</u> £000	<u>Projected Outturn</u> £000	<u>Projected Underspend</u> £000
Pitches / initial archaeological evaluation	365	312	53
Main archaeological works	300	256	44
Gross cost of current works	665	568	97
sportscotland funding	(165)	(117)	(48)
Net cost of current works (funded from borrowing)	500	451	49

Whilst the current works themselves are projecting an underspend of some £97,000, as an element of this underspend relates to the pitches the sportscotland grant funding has reduced accordingly. The net projected underspend of the current works is therefore some £49,000 and this balance may be allocated to the post excavation archaeological works.

- 6.3 With the costs of £86,630 now received for the tender for post-excavation archaeological works, and taking into account the underspend from the pitch / main archaeological works of £49,000, a funding shortfall of just under £38,000 is evident. This figure will be met from current year revenue underspend

## 7. FUTURE OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL REMAINS

- 7.1 The post excavation analysis, conservation, publication and final archiving are due for completion in February 2019. The final report will be submitted to both the archive of the National Monuments Record and the Angus Sites & Monuments Record archive. After this the

finds will be advertised through the Treasure Trove Unit so all interested museums can apply. As with all finds where the original owner cannot be identified, the Scottish Archaeological Finds Allocation Panel will recommend to the Queen's and Lord Treasurer's Remembrancer which museum should be allocated the finds.

- 7.2 To ensure that the finds including the Bronze Age hoard can return to Angus both Angus Council and Aberdeenshire Council Archaeology Service can make the case for the retention of the finds in the local area. To be able to achieve this safe and appropriate archiving and display opportunities and appropriate storage (monitored and stable climatic conditions) and security measures (the hoard artefacts are of high value, and will require insurance and specialist security measures) must be demonstrated.
- 7.3 Currently Angus Alive has planned to provide facilities in the remodelled Carnoustie Library for the public display of the Bronze Age hoard. The necessary space and funding should be found to display a model of the Carnoustie site at Neolithic times in the vicinity of the hoard and all required interpretation of the finds and their context in history.

**NOTE:** The background papers, as detailed by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) which were relied on to a material extent in preparing the above report are:

Communities Committee 17/01/17      Report No 28/17 – Supply of archaeological services, Balmachie Road Development, Carnoustie

**REPORT AUTHOR: STRATEGIC DIRECTOR - PLACE**  
**EMAIL DETAILS: [Communitiesbusinesssupport@angus.gov.uk](mailto:Communitiesbusinesssupport@angus.gov.uk)**