

PLANNING APPLICATION REF. 17/00687/FULL

DESCRIPTION OF DEVELOPMENT:

DRAINAGE INFRASTRUCTURE OPERATIONS COMPRISING UNDERGROUND PIPEWORK AND FORMATION OF A DETENTION BASIN AND OUTFALL INCLUDING FOUL WATER CONNECTION TO PUBLIC NETWORK ASSOCIATED WITH PLANNING PERMISSION IN PRINCIPLE APPEAL PPA-120-2033 RESULTING IN THE FORMATION OF AN EMPLOYMENT AREA COMPRISING CLASS 4 (BUSINESS), CLASS 5 (GENERAL INDUSTRY) AND CLASS 6 (STORAGE AND DISTRIBUTION) USES AND REALIGNMENT OF CARLOGIE ROAD

AT

FIELD 500M NORTH WEST OF PANBRIDE SCHOOL CARNOUSTIE

REPRESENTATIONS

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mr Brian Carr

Address: 2 Craigmill Gardens Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: While supporting any attempt to create employment in the area I feel that I must ask for the following observations be considered if this project is to proceed.

This development is on the main access for visitors to the town. It is important that any industrial development does not "spoil" the scenic nature of the approach and exit from the town. Although the planning application mentions screening with trees and hedgerows at various points, it is not clear that this will be done on the south of the development specifically on the high ground overlooking Carnoustie. If this is not done effectively it will impact not only on the view of visitors leaving the town but also on the outlook of the residents on the northern boundary of that part of Carnoustie.

I am also concerned about the fencing, or lack of it, around the Central and Southern basins.

Children are often inquisitive and daring by nature and it would be better that these basins were securely fenced off rather than risk a future tragedy.

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mr Garry Cooper

Address: Havel House Panbride Road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Having read the application containing the proposed development plans for the Business and Industrial Park at Carlogie I wish to raise the following observations/objections in respect to aspects of the plans as submitted:

1. Screening of the site. The plans include details of landscaping planned for the north of the site by way of trees and hedgerows. No consideration however has been given to any form of landscaping along the site's southernmost boundary on high ground overlooking Panbride and Carnoustie's north eastern housing development. This needs to be addressed to avoid spoiling the outlook of residents, pedestrians and visitors alike. It is recommended a requirement to include sympathetic landscaping along the site's southernmost boundary to include hedgerows and trees is made an essential prerequisite to planning approval being granted. Such a screening would also ensure a reduction in both noise and light pollution to those living alongside Panbride Road.
2. Siting of the Central and Southern Detention Basins. The plans as submitted pay too little attention to the real dangers associated with siting the Basins adjacent to pathways and a recreational/sports field within their close proximity. The pathways along Panbride/Newton Road are always used by schoolchildren walking to and from Carnoustie High School. Similarly the recreational/sports field on the corner between Newton and Carlogie Roads is in regular use for organised adult and junior football as well as recreational activities often involving unsupervised children. Siting the Basins so close demands adequate teenager proof fencing around each (rather than the Toddler fence proposed around the Southern Basin only) as well as proper danger

signage.

3. It is important that limitations be imposed on the developers restricting the nature and type of industries that can use the site. With a Primary School and private housing lying within 200 to 700 meters of the industrial site, Carnoustie residents do not want a repetition of the recent Anaerobic Digester fiasco, which clearly angered many. Assurances should be demanded that there will be no combustible, explosive or obnoxious substances stored or produced on site.

4. Notwithstanding the need for sympathetic screening along the southern boundary of the site, sensible limitations should be imposed on the height of the Class 5 and Class 6 buildings given the site is on elevated ground overlooking Carnoustie".

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Jessie McGlashan

Address: 23 Panbride Road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Having reviewed the application I feel I must voice my concerns over the safety of the Central and Southern basins.

One of the reports available with this application advises 'toddler height fencing as no unsupervised children will be near the basin and no warning signs required'. While I agree these basins are on private land children of all ages go back and forth along Panbride Road, Newton Road and Carlogie Road unsupervised to school and to the recreational park in Newton Road. Children are inquisitive and also will dare each other to do things so I am sure they will quite easily jump a 'toddler fence' to investigate the basin and may not appreciate or understand the grave consequences of their actions if they fall in to these basins.

We also have deer and foxes here which are both more than capable of clearing 'toddler fencing'. With no grates to cover these basins do we allow children or animals to get in danger and worse case scenario drown?

I would suggest 7 ft fencing that bend out at the top to prevent anyone climbing over or animals jumping over that are surrounded by hedges to conceal them for resident's and visitors as they will be beside one of the main routes into the town.

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mr robert harper

Address: 5, Panbride road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment:Regarding the proposed development plans for the business and industrial park at carlogie

1. No mention of screening at the southern boundary of the development. most houses on panbride road look directly over open fields to the proposed development
2. What height of proposed buildings on development. Would screening be high enough to block it
3. The southern basin will be directly adjacent to houses on panbride road and corner of carlogie road. To risk assess that toddler height fencing is all that is required does not take into consideration that it is opposite a recreational park where it is not toddlers you would risk assess, more the teenagers that would be a problem. This is also the main thoroughfare for primary and secondary school children, not toddlers..for the central basin, I believe there is still proposed housing opposite this site on carlogie road.
4. Whatever the outcome for this development, this is the main route into carnoustie, for visitors and residents, passing through an industrial site does not seem right even with screening facilities

4.

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Valerie Hughes

Address: The orchard Panbride Road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Although I have no objection in principle to the light industrial, business park proposed, I do have some concerns regarding the screening of such a site on the southern boundary. The area proposed is in a prominent position on one of the main approaches to Carnoustie and therefore should be sympathetically screened.

I also have some concerns regarding the basins proposed particularly the low toddler fencing around the southern basin. I would suggest that more adequate fencing should be considered if future tragedies are to be avoided.

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mr Glyn Roberts

Address: Janefield Cottage Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Notes I have on the proposed plan:

- 1) As a father of young children and a Panbride Road resident, I am seriously concerned by both the central detention basin and (in particular) the south detention basin. Why do either basins need to be so close to residential areas? The talk of "toddler fencing" being used around something which would be so close to thoroughfares which are used by both supervised and unsupervised children is ludicrous and extremely worrying.
- 2) Whilst care and attention seems to have been (unnecessarily) made to the screening of the site on the north side, no such care and attention has been given to the south side. Some consideration must surely be given to the south boundary as it is this side of the development which is viewed by numerous residents as well as visitors and pedestrians alike.
- 3) Again, as a father of a child who attends the local primary school, I would hope that each company/industry goes through a rigorous vetting process before being considered for property at the industrial site. As Mr Cooper mentions, assurances need to be given so that certain substances are not stored or produced on site.

Personally, I cannot see the need for this industrial site and definitely do not see the need to have it in the proposed location. If the industrial site goes ahead then I seriously hope my concerns are addressed.

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Miss Lisa Jarrett

Address: Alexandra Cottage Panbride Road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I strongly object to this plan as I believe it is the wrong location for such a development and it is wrong to keep building on our precious greenbelt, there is an abundance of natural wildlife here that should be retained and respected. I believe there are many safety concerns associated with this plan that have not been adequately addressed; the formation of basins and the natural curiosity of the many local children that live in the area sends alarm bells. Is there going to be any pungent odors or noise being omitted from the site? How high are the buildings going to be, and is there going to be enough screening of the right kind in place? Alteration of Carlogie Road is a large concern as it is already a fast road and realignment I fear will encourage more speeding and safety concerns for residents. My biggest concern though, is the implications of developing land on a higher gradient to the already existing properties in Panbride, is this going to cause future problems for the residents with excess water over time if the natural drainage has been made hard standing?

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Fiona Jarrett

Address: Alexandra Cottage Panbride Road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: The decision was made for the business and industrial site to be located at Pitskelly. The town does NOT NEED another business park. The Carlogie and Panbride area is prime agricultural, productive land and should never be sited for development. This whole plan is totally unnecessary and not sustainable for this area. We are most concerned about what kind of businesses that will move into the site; as an asthma sufferer I am deeply concerned about the uncertainty and the possibility of obnoxious smells/fumes that may be produced from the site, not to mention the poor air quality, breathing problems and even noise pollution. I wish to echo the important comment made by Mr Garry Cooper suggesting that assurances should be demanded that there are to be no combustible, explosive or obnoxious substances of any kind to be stored or produced on site at any time. My husband and I both agree with all the other comments of objection made regarding this unsustainable plan.

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mr William Jarrett

Address: Alexandra Cottage Panbride Road Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: My main concern with this plan is water retention on the lower ground behind the properties North of Panbride Road and how the buildings are to be screened on the south side. I do not agree with the realignment of Carlogie Road at all. I agree very much with all the other comments of objection that have been listed so far as they are very realistic views of concern that I hope will be listened to.



LTR/3789/45/JR

29 September 2017

Mr Ruari Kelly
Angus Council
Planning & Transport
County Buildings
Market Street
Forfar
Angus
DD8 3LG

Dear Mr Kelly

**TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997
OBJECTION BY DJ LAING HOMES LIMITED AND K & D HENDERSON TO PLANNING
APPLICATIONS – REF NO.: 17/00685/FULL; 17/00686/FULL; AND 17/00687/FULL –
FOR DEVELOPMENT AT CARLOGIE ROAD, CARNOUSTIE
PLANNING OBJECTION**

With reference to the undernoted planning applications:

- **Reference 17/00685/FULL – Field West Of Carlogie Road Carnoustie**
Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network and Construction of Section of Road associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road
- **Reference 17/00686/FULL – Field 570M East Of Carlogie Hotel Carnoustie**
Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network and Construction of Section of Road associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road
- **Reference 17/00687/FULL – Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie**
Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

The Voigt Partnership Limited • Studio 1 • Erskine House Business & Design Centre • Commerce Street • Arbroath • DD11 1WB
Telephone: 01241 879662 • Fax: 01241 870406 • Email: admin@voigtpartnership.co.uk • www.voigtpartnership.co.uk

Directors: Heinz Voigt, John Cullen, Maureen King

The Voigt Partnership Limited is a Limited Company registered in Scotland No. SC380679 whose Registered Office is at Studio 1, Erskine House Business & Design Centre, Commerce Street, Arbroath, DD11 1WB
VAT Registration No. 415 4378 56

I have been instructed by my clients – D J Laing Homes Ltd and K & D Henderson (Farm Land owner) - to object to these proposals.

It is noted that all three planning application areas / sites utilise land which is located:

- Outwith the site boundaries associated with planning application 14/00043/PPPM – formation of an employment area comprising class 4 (business), class 5 (general industry) and class 6 (storage and distribution) uses and realignment of Carlogie Road – which was approved by a Scottish Government Inquiry Reporter on 19 August 2104 (PPA ref – 120-2033 refers);
- Outwith the development boundary for Carnoustie settlement as set out in the Adopted Angus Local Development Plan – adopted by Angus Council on 23 September 2016 – and shown on Inset Map 3 and consequently not identified for development purposes;
- Outwith the boundaries associated with Local Development Plan Proposal C6 Working – Land at Carlogie as shown on page 99 of the published plan and illustrated on Inset Map 3.

All three sites are therefore physically outwith but contiguous (sharing an edge or boundary, neighbouring or adjacent as defined by the Angus LDP) with the development boundary for the town.

Angus Council has defined development boundaries to protect the landscape setting of the towns and villages and prevent the uncontrolled spread of development. In terms of development principles the local development plan indicates that sites within the development boundaries are the preferred location for most development. Given the above it is my clients' contention that these applications are not in accord with the adopted Local Development Plan position, being contrary to Policy DS1 Development Boundaries and Priorities (ALDP page 10). This indicates that "proposals for sites outwith but contiguous with a development boundary will only be acceptable where it is in the public interest and social, economic, environmental or operational considerations confirm that there is a need for the proposed development that cannot be met within a development boundary".

The Planning Statement accompanying and common to all the planning application submissions sets out the background and history to the development but is particularly light on the justification for the additional land requirement and also why it cannot in part be contained within the approved development area. Both the central and south detention basins in particular are located in a visually prominent area and if they can be justified as an essential requirement should be relocated to a less visually intrusive site. My clients are also concerned at the detail associated with the north detention basin which appears to be designed for specific activity/use but which is not clarified in either the planning statement or the planning application for Approved Matters Specified in Conditions (MSCM) Planning Reference: **17/00661/MSCM**. This requires further clarification.

It is noted in the letter dated 7 August from the applicants agents, accompanying the submission of the various related planning applications, that the 'implementation of the development proposals will depend upon the grant of further planning permissions for the A930 Carlogie Road realignment, storm water management and drainage on other land outside the PPP boundary'.

My clients remain concerned that the case for the current off site works to construct the roads and drainage infrastructure has not been fully made and given the recent history of the applicants in seeking to


bring forward major residential development in the Carlogie area of the town, through both the Angus local development plan process and the planning application process (planning appeal reference PPA -120-2041) are concerned that the case is not fully transparent.

Other options for the provision of employment land exist in the shape of land at Pitskelly Farm which is included in the adopted Angus Local Development Plan (proposals C1 Housing – land at Pitskelly and C7 Working – Land at Pitskelly) and also benefits from planning permission in principle (ref 14/00573PPPM). Development will be within the development area and my clients' are progressing to implementation of both employment and housing development in the very near future having now agreed all matters with their consultants to engage with the carious authorities and confirm this process is currently underway having had initial consultations with Angus Council planning and roads authority and also a range of utility services.

Legislation requires decisions on planning applications to made in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. In this case the planning application sites are located outside the approved original planning application in principle, the local development plan boundary for Carnoustie and more specifically local plan proposal C3. Justification to deviate from the development plan position and in particular Policy DS1 Development Boundaries and Priorities has not been made.

I would respectfully request that the applications be refused or at best deferred to allow greater clarity on this matter.

Yours sincerely

A large black rectangular redaction box covering the signature area.

HEINZ VOIGT
for The Voigt Partnership Limited

Comments for Planning Application 17/00687/FULL

Application Summary

Application Number: 17/00687/FULL

Address: Field 500M North West Of Panbride School Carnoustie

Proposal: Drainage Infrastructure Operations Comprising Underground Pipework and Formation of a Detention Basin and Outfall including Foul Water Connection to Public Network associated with Planning Permission in Principle Appeal PPA-110-2033 Resulting in the Formation of an Employment Area Comprising Class 4 (Business), Class 5 (General Industry) and Class 6 (Storage and Distribution) Uses and Realignment of Carlogie Road

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

Customer Details

Name: Mr Nigel Robinson

Address: 24 Craigmill Gardens Carnoustie

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: This plan to have an industrial site on the main artery into the town is supported to a point as the current facilities are difficult to access for large vehicles. There are some concerns that I have in relation to the planning application.

1) the south basin is too close to Panbride Road where current housing will overlook it. This should be 200m further north and well screened off with a high fence and trees. It presents a potential hazard for youths and roaming children and deer which are often in this field. Can we be assured that there will be no noxious smells coming from this? Further away from houses is a better option.

2) the screening of the south side is important that current houses that face north do not have to look out on an industrial park, rather trees and shrubs in an suitably aesthetic display. Currently from our bedroom window we have a view of this field. This is an area of natural beauty and should be maintained as best as possible. Also from a security and access point, high fences are important around this boundary and around the middle basin .

3) as this site is on the top of the hill overlooking Carnoustie if the buildings are too high they will be very obvious. As with building a house in the top of a hill, perhaps it should be limited to a story and a half in height.

4) the staggered junction of Carlogie Road, with Newton and Panbride Roads is often quite busy

and especially difficult to turn right out of Panbride road when traffic is busy. I propose to reroute the new road slightly to make a second (mini) roundabout just north of the current junction to link Panbride road. This may also aide in the (future) applications of houses that have been proposed into the field on the west side of carlogie Road (north of the recreation ground) which could feed into the roundabout too. Future proofing is important!