

Appendix 1 – Option Appraisal

A strategic review of recycling centre provision within Angus was undertaken during early 2016. The objectives of the review were as follows:

1. Fulfil recommendation 3 of the Scrutiny and Audit Report 328/14, namely to “consider the need for the current number of recycling centres; assess the fitness for purpose of each centre; look at options for extending the range of materials that can be recycled at the centres; and highlight investment needed to create an appropriate number of centres to complement the kerbside recycling service.”
2. Realise an ongoing annual saving of £250,000 as agreed at a special meeting of Angus Council held on 13 February 2014.
3. Facilitate increased opportunities for recycling and reuse at recycling centres in line with the Scottish Governments Zero Waste Plan.
4. Improve traffic management at recycling centres by reducing waiting times for customers while skips are being exchanged and eliminating traffic congestion.
5. Provide strategic regional coverage of recycling centres within Angus with facilities located in or near to areas with the highest population density.
6. Provide an appropriate number of recycling centres for a council with the population size of Angus.
7. Deliver maximum availability of centres in terms of opening hours within the resources available

A number of potential options were identified for consideration and an option appraisal exercise was undertaken to help select the preferred option. This involved the scoring of each identified option against each of the above 7 objectives.

The same option appraisal exercise has been carried out again to compare the preferred option from 2016 (as recommended to Communities Committee in [Report 209/16](#)) with the option now being recommended in September 2018. The two options are summarised below.

2016 Option – Retention of 3 recycling centres at Arbroath, Montrose and new Centre in the Forfar/Kirriemuir locality. The full closure of other Centres – Montrose, Monifieth, Carnoustie, Kirriemuir and Brechin Recycling Centres.

2018 option – Retention of all 7 recycling centres. Arbroath, Forfar (to be expanded) and Montrose recycling centres would accept all waste and recycling and open full time 7 days per week. The other Centres would only accept materials for recycling (no general waste) and open 5 days per week.

The same methodology has been used however the scoring takes into account the impact of the new contract for general waste disposal that commenced from November 2017 and the enhanced focus on minimising general waste and maximising recycling. The results are shown in table 1.

Table 1: Scoring of options against objectives

Positive alignment to objective scored as low (1), medium (2) or high (3)

Objective	2016 option	2018 option	Comment
Fulfil recommendation 3 of the Scrutiny and Audit Report 328/14	3	3	Both options will lead to increasing the range of recycling facilities available at Centres, however by providing a Centre in each borough, the 2018 option better complements the kerbside service. Removing general waste from smaller centres makes them more fit for purpose.
Realise an ongoing £250,000 annual saving	3	3	Both options are forecasted to deliver the saving target. If the 60% recycling target is achieved then the 2018 option will deliver a significant additional saving.
Facilitate increased recycling and reuse at recycling centres	3	3	Both options would increase recycling through the provision of a greater range of recycling facilities. The 2018 option has the potential to deliver a higher rate of recycling linked to more local recycling facilities and a better alignment to a public engagement campaign.

Improve traffic management at the recycling centres, including waiting times for customers	3	3	Both options would deliver improvements. The 2016 option would close Centres where space is most restricted and the 2018 option would reduce traffic at smaller Centres by diverting customers to the Centres with larger footprints and longer opening hours.
Provide strategic regional coverage of Recycling Centres within Angus	2	3	The 2016 option would mean more residents having to travel further compared with 2018 option, which retains a facility for recycling in each borough of Angus.
Provide an appropriate number of recycling centres for a council with the population size of Angus	3	3	Based solely on population, 3 recycling centres is considered adequate for a council with population size of Angus, however the 2018 option has the added benefit of retaining more Centres for the collection of recyclable materials
Maximise opening hours within resources available	2	3	Both options provide full time, seven day opening at the busiest three recycling centres. The 2018 option also provides five day opening at the smaller sites.
Totals	19	21	

The 2018 option scores marginally higher than the 2016 option and a SWOT analysis (shown in table 2) identified that the 2018 option does have more strengths and opportunities than the 2016 option, such as reducing the distances residents will be required to travel to recycle their waste and the potential to significantly increase recycling rates in Angus.

Table 2 – SWOT analysis

	2016 Option	2018 Option
Strengths	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> £250k savings target will be delivered Roller packers (for compacting waste in skips) available at all sites, which would increase payloads of skips and reduce number of skip movements. Same full time opening hours and 7 days access to Centres. Development of new site and redeveloped sites reduces incidences where sites are closed during opening hours to allow servicing of skips. The 3 remaining Centres would provide the full range of recycling containers available allowing visitors to maximise the amount they recycle. Encourages residents to recycle at home rather than taking excess bags of waste to nearby recycling centre. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> £250k savings target will be exceeded if 60% recycling within centres is achieved. Roller packers (for compacting waste in skips) available at 3 busiest sites, which would increase payloads of skips and reduce number of skip movements. Full time opening hours and 7 days access to 3 busiest Centres, 5 days access to others. The 3 sites accepting general waste will be designed to reduce incidences where sites are closed during opening hours to allow servicing of skips. All the Centres would provide a full range of recycling containers. Retains a facility for recycling larger items that can't go in household recycling bins in each borough. Reduces the distances residents will be required to travel to recycle their waste (compared with 2016 option). Encourages residents to recycle at home rather than taking excess bags of waste to recycling centre. Additional staff resource at 3 centres accepting general waste to engage more with customers and manage traffic more effectively. Better control of unauthorised use of Centres by commercial businesses via household permit scheme and ANPR.

Weaknesses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased distance to travel to nearest Recycling Centre for a large proportion of Angus residents Significant increase in traffic at remaining Centres 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There will still be potential for increased distance to travel to nearest Recycling Centre but for disposal of general waste only. Inconsistent/variable hours between Centres.
Opportunities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Development of a new facility to serve Forfar, Kirriemuir and surrounding areas Opportunities for partnerships with not-for-profit groups to run reuse shops at larger retained centres 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The continued provision of a recycling centre in each borough is more compatible and aligned to a campaign to encourage public to increase recycling. Opportunity to surpass the 60% recycling target and deliver a more significant saving as well as further reducing carbon impact. Opportunities for partnerships with not-for-profit groups to run reuse shops at larger centres
Threats	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Traffic congestion at remaining Centres causing delays for customers Increase in fly tipping incidents linked to reluctance to travel further to recycling centre The increased travel distances and congestion at the 3 remaining sites would have negative impact on public attitude to recycling when on site. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Traffic congestion at 3 busiest Centres causing delays for customers Increase in fly tipping incidents linked to reluctance to travel further to dispose of general waste Public confusion and frustration at variances in the types of waste accepted and opening hours between Centres. Increased contamination of recycling skips at Centres where no general waste skip is provided. Risk that saving target will not be met if recycling if recycling rate is not sufficiently increased.

Appendix 2 – Materials accepted at recycling centres

The table below shows the materials that would be accepted at all seven recycling centres and provides examples of the non-recyclable materials that would only be accepted at Arbroath, Forfar and Montrose recycling centres.

Materials accepted at all seven recycling centres	Materials only accepted at Arbroath, Forfar and Montrose recycling centres
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bikes • Cans • Car batteries (and household) • Cardboard • Cooking oil • Electrical and electronic equipment, e.g. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ fridges and freezers ○ cookers ○ washing machines ○ televisions and monitors ○ small appliances such as kettles and toasters ○ fluorescent tubes and lightbulbs • Engine Oil • Food waste • Garden waste • Gas bottles • Glass • Paper • Plastic bottles • Stone/Rubble • Soil • Scrap metal • Shoes and handbags • Textiles • Wood 	<p>All non-recyclable wastes, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mattresses • Settees • Carpets • Hard plastics such as toys, plant pots, buckets and garden furniture • Plastic wrap and film • Ceramics (baths, sinks, toilets) • Tiles • Windows and mirrors • Food-tainted items such as used paper plates, boxes and paper towels • Black bags where contents are not known <p>This list is not intended to be exhaustive, but illustrates some examples of what would be deemed “general waste”</p>

Appendix 3 – Proposed opening hours at Centres and changes to container provision

The table below summarises the proposed changes to opening hours and materials collected at each recycling Centre.

Location	Current opening hours	Proposed opening hours	Changes to materials accepted on site
Arbroath	9.15am to 4pm – Monday to Sunday	No change other than evening opening to be introduced on Wednesday 9.15pm to 7pm*	No change
Forfar	Monday - 10am - 4pm Tuesday - 10am - 4pm Wednesday - 1pm - 7pm* Thursday - 10am - 4pm Friday - 10am - 4pm Saturday - 9.15am - 4pm Sunday - 9.15am - 4pm	9.15am to 4pm – every day except Wednesday which will retain evening opening 12.15pm – 7pm*	No Change to materials accepted but additional containers for general waste, wood and garden waste to be made available through redevelopment of site.
Montrose	Monday - 10am - 4pm Tuesday - 10am - 4pm Wednesday - 1pm - 7pm* Thursday - 10am - 4pm Friday - 10am - 4pm Saturday - 9.15am - 4pm Sunday - 9.15am - 4pm	9.15am to 4pm – every day except Wednesday which will retain evening opening 12.15pm – 7pm*	No change
Brechin	Monday - closed Tuesday - 10am - 4pm Wednesday - 1pm - 7pm* Thursday - 10am - 4pm Friday - closed Saturday - 9.15am - 4pm Sunday - 9.15am - 4pm	No change apart from: Saturday - 10am - 4pm Sunday - 10am - 4pm	General waste skip will be removed and a rubble/soil skip will be introduced.
Carnoustie	Monday - 10am - 4pm Tuesday - closed Wednesday - 1pm - 7pm* Thursday - closed Friday - 10am - 4pm Saturday - 9.15am - 4pm Sunday - 9.15am - 4pm	No change apart from: Saturday - 10am - 4pm Sunday - 10am - 4pm	General waste skip will be removed and replaced with additional skip for garden waste or timber.
Kirriemuir	Monday - 10am - 4pm Tuesday - 10am - 4pm Wednesday - 1pm - 7pm* Thursday - 10am - 4pm Friday - closed Saturday - 9.15am - 4pm Sunday - 9.15am - 4pm	No change apart from: Monday - Closed Saturday - 10am - 4pm Sunday - 10am - 4pm	General waste skip will be removed and a rubble/soil skip will be introduced
Monifieth	Monday - 10am - 4pm Tuesday - 10am - 4pm Wednesday - closed Thursday - 1pm - 7pm* Friday - closed Saturday - 9.15am - 4pm Sunday - 9.15am - 4pm	No change apart from: Saturday - 10am - 4pm Sunday - 10am - 4pm	General waste skip will be removed and replaced with additional skip for garden waste or timber.

* Later evening opening hours are seasonal only (1 April to 30 September)