

ANGUS COUNCIL

SPECIAL MEETING – 18 SEPTEMBER 2018

WINTER MAINTENANCE FOOTWAY TREATMENT

REPORT BY HEAD OF INFRASTRUCTURE

ABSTRACT

This report has been prepared following the agreement of a motion by Council on 6 September 2018 and presents options for Members' consideration and agreement.

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Council:

- (i) notes the options in Section 6 and detailed in **Appendix 5** of this Report to provide winter footway services in accordance with the allocated budget and in accordance with the statutory duty under the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984:
- (ii) determines which option and policy to implement for the 2018/19 season, in consideration of the risks set out in Section 8; and
- (iii) notes the future consultation as set out in the motion of 6 September 2018 and as detailed in Section 7 which seeks an approach as to the future policy.

2. ALIGNMENT TO THE ANGUS LOCAL OUTCOMES IMPROVEMENT PLAN/CORPORATE PLAN

This report contributes to the following local outcomes contained within the Angus Local Outcomes Improvement Plan and Locality Plans:

ECONOMY

- An inclusive and sustainable economy

PLACE

- Safe, secure, vibrant and sustainable communities
- An enhanced, protected and enjoyed natural and built environment

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 The motion was as follows:

1. *This Council instructs the Strategic Director of Place to carry out a Review of the Winter Service Policy & Provision 2018/2019 to create a more equitable policy of pavement gritting between our borough towns and villages which re-introduces by 2018/2019 pavement gritting into all Angus Villages, which were previously receiving this provision.*
2. *The New Policy will be created within the Existing Budget of £2,613,000 and will be cost neutral.*
3. *Ensures that consultation is always carried out with our Local Communities and Community Planning Partners when re-designing Angus Council's Winter Service Policy and Provision and that the results of the consultation are included in all Budget and Committee Papers.*
4. *Brings back a Report to the Special Council Meeting of 18th Sept 2018 for Councils Agreement.*

Item 3 was clarified at Council that this element of the motion applied for future years. This Report addresses the various aspects of the motion.

3.2 The Change Programme for financial year 2018/19 included £50,000 saving from a Reduced Service Level of Winter Maintenance – Footpaths which was presented and agreed at the Policy & Budget Strategy Group (PBSG) on 27 June 2017.

3.3 At the PBSG meeting on 11 January 2018, it was agreed that the impact of inflation on winter maintenance costs of £54,000 should be met within the service. This was in line with the budget guidance and in light of the significant funding gap which already existed for the 2018/19 revenue budget.

- 3.4 The PBSG meeting on 29 January 2018 agreed the further service level reduction as subsequently set out in Schedule 3d of Report 59/18 Angus Council Special Angus Council (**Appendix 1**).
- 3.5 Report 59/18 was approved at Special Angus Council meeting on 15 February 2018 and following the approval, officers arranged for the disposal of vehicles and arrangements for reduced labour levels through Tayside Contracts.
- 3.6 The Winter Service Policy and Provision for 2018/19 was reported to Communities Committee on 14 August 2018 in Information Report 229/18 Schedule 3 and included the reduction in service levels including the Burgh footways that would be treated as future priority routes.

4 CURRENT POSITION

- 4.1 Winter services are delivered through third parties, with the majority being delivered by Tayside Contracts with some sub-contracting to agricultural contractors/farmers.
- 4.2 The estimated budget costs associated with winter maintenance for 2018/19, taking into account the savings in footway mini-tractors, is as follows:

Weather forecasting and Icelert stations		£42,000
Tayside Contracts Standing Charges fixed costs include:		
Specialist Vehicles such as carriageway gritters; towed gritters; footway mini-tractors; snow blower (depreciation/lease; tax; insurance; servicing);	£635,000	
Operational Lorries (demounts) used for winter	£84,000	
Loading shovels (proportion used for winter)	£18,000	
Snow ploughs and blades	£9,000	
Depots/weighbridges costs (portion of used for winter activities)	£104,000	
Standby payments, training;	£160,000	
Overheads and On-costs	£190,000	£1,200,000
Operational costs include running costs of vehicles, driver costs and payments to outside contractors for assistance with snow clearing (based on average year)		£795,000
Salt purchase (based on an average year 12,000t usage)		£576,000
Total		£2,613,000

- 4.3 The operational costs are the only area that the council has the opportunity to change at this stage in the year. There are variable costs associated with treating carriageways and footways, and self-help grit bins. The costs are made up of three main components; the cost of labour (time for mini-tractor drivers, support operatives etc); the running cost of vehicles (the mini-tractor, spreaders, trailers and vehicles to move location etc); and the cost of materials (salt).
- 4.4 Members are reminded of the current Policy as set out in **Appendix 2** which gives priority to the more important and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network in the most efficient, effective and economic way.
- 4.5 Through the Society of Chief Officers for Transportation Scotland (SCOTS) benchmark data is provided periodically across Scottish authorities. In terms of the length of footways receiving winter treatment for the last survey in 2013, completed by 27 of the 32 authorities, Angus Council treated 37% of its footways as priorities, with only one island council treating more. The national average treatment length was 12% of the network. In the same survey, within our benchmark group of 8 comparable councils; 6 councils submitted returns and excluding Angus the average treatment figure was 7% of the footways. Therefore Angus has been treating over 5 times the average amount of footways as our peers. This was due to be reduced for the 2018/19 season by the reduction in footway mini-tractors.
- 4.6 With the agreed reduction in the budgets, the principles of the policy to "...use the resources available for winter maintenance in the most efficient, effective and economic way ..." and "...gives priority to the more important and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network (both carriageways and footways)" were considered in the allocation of the remaining 10 mini-tractors to the Burgh towns, set out in Schedule 3d of Report 59/18.
- 4.7 The removal of the gritting service to outlying areas remains the most efficient, effective and economic use of the vehicles and labour. Due to the wide spread settlements in Angus, treating out with the main population areas requires mini-tractors to be load/unloaded and transported to the area to be treated

which is not efficient. Treating footways on the areas of high population means that the most used footways are treated which has a greater impact.

- 4.8 The winter service cannot be seen in isolation from other roads related activities. The workforce is provided through Tayside Contracts and there needs to be a balanced approach where staff required to deliver the winter maintenance service can be productively employed during the rest of the year on general roads maintenance, including during mild weather in the winter, in addition to spring, summer and autumn seasons. Members are aware that capital, supplementary capital and Renewals and Repairs funding has fallen by 19 per cent over this year and primarily due to the cessation of Renewal & Repair funding on affordability grounds is due to fall by 50 per cent of the 2017/18 funding in 2019/20. This is a fall of £4m budget provision in two years.
- 4.9 The reduction in footway mini-tractors fleet assisted the balance of workload as footway treatment is labour intensive requiring both the mini-tractor and a pick up support to keep the vehicle supplied with salt. Reducing the number of vehicles from 20 to 10 assists towards the known reduction in the workload for non-winter activities.

5 REVIEW OF FOOTWAY WINTER SERVICE

- 5.1 Report No 263/18 Medium Term Budget Strategy 2019/20 – 2021/22 to Council on 6 September 2018, noted the current budget gap and that one of the budget pressures is inflationary costs. With the baseline forecast of £36.5m representing 17 per cent reductions in council budgets, equivalent to 14 times the total winter maintenance budget the current policy decisions need to be viewed in light of the future budget situation and sustainability of services delivered now and into the future. The winter services budget of £2.6m makes up appropriately 1 per cent of the council's overall revenue budget and unlike many other aspects of the revenue budget, winter services remains an area that Members have some discretion as to the level of service provided. Going forward it is likely that further reductions to winter maintenance will be necessary.
- 5.2 Value for money is a consideration in setting a policy, which is linked to route efficiency. Route efficiency is dependent on a number of issues, such as travel time to the location, loading/unloading of vehicles and salt; variance in widths of footway (requiring the tractor to dismount the footway); and circular routes allowing salt to be continuously spread rather than re-running over previously treated routes.
- 5.3 The Roads (Scotland) Act 1984 Section 34 places a duty on the Roads Authority to take such steps as it considers reasonable to prevent snow and ice endangering the safe passage of pedestrians and vehicles over public roads. It is therefore incumbent on Angus Council to determine the measures which it deems appropriate for the winter service on its public roads taking into account its overall priorities and available resources.
- 5.4 The council's winter services, as with the other aspects of the road services, are delivered in line with 'Well-maintained Highways: Code of Practice for Highway Maintenance Management'. The winter service policy to date has served the council well in terms of liability; it is a risk-based approach in line with the Code of Practice. Aspects to be considered in determining which routes are to be prioritised:
- Geography – flat roads and footways are a lower risk than inclines; coastal locations are impacted less by winter weather than inland areas; higher altitude as exemplified by Kirriemuir are more prone to freezing/snow conditions.
 - Usage – areas of larger populations; facilities such as schools, retail, health services; etc generate increased footfall. Access to such facilities is essential for the staff as well as the visitors/customers.
- 5.5 Taking the above into consideration Members need to consider where to focus the limited resources to maximise impact and benefit taking into account efficiencies and risk, and adapt this to satisfy the agreed motion to create a more equitable policy. To assist, some statistics for the Burgh Towns is given in **Appendix 3** and statistics for the villages are given in **Appendix 4**.
- 5.6 An in-house appraisal of the facilities and geography has been undertaken and scores allocated to each general area and recorded on Appendices 3 and 4. In line with previous priorities for Schools and Learning, secondary schools are given a higher priority than primary schools due to the potential disruption to students studying for exams. Minor injury units are given higher priority than health centres which are in turn given higher priority than other health care facilities such as a pharmacy.
- 5.7 The treatment of priority footways starts at 6 a.m. Operatives arrive directly in Arbroath, Brechin, and Forfar and then move to other locations from the Tayside Contracts depots in either Arbroath or Forfar. Mini-tractors are garaged in each Burgh. For the villages, the mini-tractors are stored in Arbroath and Forfar and transported to the locations to start operations by trailer. Therefore footway treatment in villages starts sometime after 6 a.m.
- 5.8 Ideally the treatments would be complete before 9 a.m. for priority routes, before the substantial footway traffic i.e. travelling to school/work occurs. In periods of black ice or snow these times would be significantly extended as the vehicles travel at reduced speed. For salt to be effective it needs to form a solution and this works best when agitated by foot traffic.

6 OPTIONS

- 6.1 The agreed motion requires the revisions to be cost neutral within the winter maintenance budget.
- 6.2 **Appendix 5** gives details of a number of options explored in this review, as well as the position agreed by Council in Report 59/18 Schedule 3d.
- 6.3 The villages that were previously receiving footway treatment are listed in **Appendix 4** indicating which were prioritised. For completeness those villages where there are schools but not necessarily footways and which did not previously receive footway treatment are also listed.
- 6.4 With the reduced budgets and consequential reduction in available labour and vehicles it is not possible to reinstate the whole of the service to all the footways as pre 2018/19 in the towns or villages. There is, however, an option for Members consideration that restores partial service in some of the villages, by reducing services in the Burgh towns still further than the original proposal in Report 59/18. This option has associated risks, specifically the council treating less used footways in the villages when compared to footways in the towns.
- 6.5 If Members are minded to adopt Option 4 in **Appendix 5**, a suggested revised policy is presented in **Appendix 6** for Members' consideration and approval.
- 6.6 For Members' information and consideration **Appendix 7** lists the footways that could be treated in the towns and villages if Members were to adopt Option 4 (e to h). **Appendix 7** also notes those footways that would no longer be treated in the Burgh towns under this option.

7. PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT/CONSULTATION

- 7.1 The Winter Services Community Involvement Advisory Group was established following the changes to Winter Service Policy reported to Communities Committee on 14 August 2018, principally in relation to the management of the impact of the reduction in footway treatment from winter 2018/19 onwards and the need to engage the community to provide local services by volunteers. The Group, which is coordinated by Roads & Transportation officers, has representatives from across the council services, comprising Schools & Learning, Angus Health and Social Care Partnership, resilience, risk & insurance, health & safety, communications and community planning.
- 7.2 As discussed at the Winter Services Community Involvement Advisory Group, the Pride in Place Member Officer Group has been consulted on the best way to engage with communities to support the changes in the winter services. The Pride in Place MOG has agreed to be the conduit for the Roads & Transportation service to inform and engage with community groups and this is intended to take place ahead of winter once the routes to be treated are confirmed.
- 7.3 The proposal to undertake consultation with local communities and Community Planning Partners when re-designing Angus Council's Winter Service Policy and Provision was agreed at Council on 6 September 2018, and will consequentially be carried out for future changes. Members of the PBSG are currently considering public information/engagement/consultation as part of the budget process and winter services should be considered in the wider context of the savings set out in the Medium Term Budget Strategy rather than in isolation. Any decisions on re-designing Angus Council's Winter Service Policy and Provision and the consequent timing of any savings in light of the consultation requirements will need to be considered by the PBSG.
- 7.4 Members may also be aware that Participatory Budgeting under the Community Empowerment Act (Scotland) 2015 requires 1 per cent of the council's budget, the equivalent of the council's winter maintenance budget, to be decided by Angus communities to determine their priorities for council expenditure in future years. Communities' priority for winter maintenance should form part of this engagement.

8. RISKS

- 8.1 By adopting a policy that seeks to provide equity rather than prioritising resources to what may be considered the more frequently used and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network on the basis of risk, the council may be exposed to the risk of litigation in the instance where there is an incident as a result of a change to the previous policy and approach.
- 8.2 If Members were minded to agree Option 1 in **Appendix 5** there is a risk that replacement footway mini-tractors and spreading equipment would not be in place in time to deal with weather conditions in 2018/19 season.

9. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 9.1 As per the motion there are no additional financial implications arising from this report, In deciding which steps to take, Members should be mindful of the funding gap set out in the Medium Term Budget Strategy 2019/20 – 2021/22 (Report 263/18) and the medium term financial sustainability of decisions made.

NOTE: The background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) which were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above report are:

- Report No 263/18 Medium Term Budget Strategy 2019/20 – 2021/22 - 6 September 2018
- Report 229/18 Schedule 3 Communities Committee Winter Service Policy and Provision for 2018/19– 14 August 2018
- Report 59/18 Schedule 3d Angus Council Special Angus Council - 15 February 2018
- Report No 142/13 Winter Maintenance Service Review - 5 March 2013

REPORT AUTHOR: Ian Cochrane, Head of Infrastructure

EMAIL DETAILS: CommunitiesBusinessSupport@angus.gov.uk

List of Appendices –

- Appendix 1 – Schedule 3d Report 59/18 Change Programme: Reduced Service Level of Winter Maintenance –
Footways
- Appendix 2 - Winter Service 2018/2019 Policy
- Appendix 3 - Burgh Data
- Appendix 4 – Village Data
- Appendix 5 – Options
- Appendix 6 - Suggested Revised Policy
- Appendix 7 – Treatment Routes

ANGUS COUNCIL

SPECIAL ANGUS COUNCIL – 15 FEBRUARY 2018

CHANGE PROGRAMME: REDUCED SERVICE LEVEL OF WINTER MAINTENANCE - FOOTWAYS

IAN COCHRANE, HEAD OF TECHNICAL & PROPERTY SERVICES

ABSTRACT

This report relates to a review to reduce the service level of winter maintenance – footways.

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

1.1 It is recommended that Angus Council:

- (i) Agrees to reduce the service level of winter maintenance – footways, as set out in section 4 of this report.

2. ALIGNMENT TO THE ANGUS LOCAL OUTCOMES IMPROVEMENT PLAN/CORPORATE PLAN

2.1 This report contributes to the following local outcome contained within the Angus Local Outcomes Improvement Plan, Locality Plans and Council Plan:

- we want our communities to be strong, resilient and led by citizens

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 The programme involves a review to reduce service level of winter maintenance – footways. The estimated annual revenue saving is £50,000.

3.2 Budget Issues reported to the PBSG meeting held on 11 January 2018, highlighted the annual inflationary rise in service provision of £54,000. PBSG confirmed on 11 January 2018 the view that this increased cost should be met within the service.

3.3 The total saving required from the above items is £104,000.

4. PROGRESS OVERVIEW

4.1 The current level of service for winter maintenance in Angus has been examined in previous reviews and savings have been made in the past through efficiencies, spend to save and service level reductions. The revenue budget is set on the basis of an average year, currently £2.66m, however the actual cost of winter varies year on year depending on the severity of the winter.

4.2 The winter service is a statutory duty on the Council, as Roads Authority, under the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984 and the Council is required to set a policy that the Council considers reasonable to prevent snow and ice endangering the safe passage of pedestrians and vehicles over public roads. Given the level of financial austerity, Members needs to reconsider the level of service that is reasonable to be provided.

4.3 The costs of the winter service has two components: standing charges to have the specialist vehicles, equipment and materials available for winter; and operational charges when that vehicles is used with associated labour and running costs. Thus standing charges are incurred irrespective of the severity of the winter; whilst operational costs vary depending on the need to undertake treatment, which is weather dependant.

4.4 With some 1800km of carriageways and an estimated 800km of footway it is not feasible to treat all of the carriageways and footways at once. Carriageways have been prioritised, with Category 1, 2, 3 routes being priority routes, auxiliary routes; school transport routes, and non-priority routes. In the same way, footways are classed as priority (Category 1) or non-priority (Category 3) taking into account the level of pedestrian usage.

4.5 Report No 267/17 detailed the difference between the treatment of routes and down grading routes from Cat 1/2 routes to 2/3, which would require less resources. This results in fewer operational treatments and therefore lesser costs, with lower service levels.

4.6 Footway treatment is an area where the level of service in Angus is considered higher than other authorities, and the service requires resources to both drive the footway tractor and replenish the relative small capacity trailing gritter.

- 4.7 In reducing the number of footway gritters for the burgh towns from 16 to 10, the extent of the priority network would be revised and would be focussed on retail; schools; and health care routes. There would be a reduction in the amount of footways treated as Cat 1 and in extended periods of winter weather there would be a reduction in the amount of Cat 3 footways that could be treated in a day, with potential for some footways remaining untreated.
- 4.8 The resulting reduction in standing charges is estimated at £38,000 with operational costs for an average winter being estimated at £30,000; giving £68,000 of savings annually.
- 4.9 Reducing the number of footway gritters in the villages is only feasible and practicable by removing the service in its entirety due to the smaller areas and the need to transport footway gritters between villages. This would remove 4 tractors. The reduction in standing charges is estimated at £20,000 due to the current lease agreement timings, with operational costs for an average winter being estimated at £16,000; giving £36,000 of savings annually.
- 4.10 The reduction in footway gritting can therefore achieve the combined savings for the review and flat cash budget allocation for winter maintenance in 2018/19, delivering the £104,000 of savings annually.

5. NEXT STEPS

- 5.1 The detail of the footway routing will need to be revised to focus on retail; schools; and health care routes, and would be reported to Communities Committee in August 2018 as part of the annual winter policy report.
- 5.2 Footway treatment is an area that our public have expectations of service and is an area that we receive customer contact in winter, along with the remainder of the road network. There is the opportunity for communities to mitigate the impact of these reduced services levels with support from the Council. During periods of severe weather notably 2010/11, community groups, and in particular Carnoustie and Kirriemuir, had volunteers to assist in treating the footways. Assistance was provided in the form of provision of salt supplies and such opportunities would be explored in areas impacted by the service reduction. As per the Council policy, self help is encouraged and there are over 600 grit bins across the network.

NOTE: No background papers, as detailed by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) were relied on to a material extent in preparing the above report.

REPORT AUTHOR: Ian Cochrane, Head of Technical & Property Services
EMAIL DETAILS: COMMUNITIES@angus.gov.uk

**ANGUS COUNCIL
WINTER SERVICE 2018/2019 POLICY**

Angus Council will endeavour to use the resources available for winter maintenance in the most efficient, effective and economic way to prevent, as far as is considered reasonably practicable, snow and ice endangering the safe passage of pedestrians and vehicles over public roads and to minimise the inaccessibility of public roads and temporary disruption of traffic directly attributable to adverse weather conditions.

The Council will therefore operate a system of winter maintenance which gives priority to the more important and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network (both carriageways and footways).

The Council will encourage the use of self-help measures, including community-led provision of some local winter services.

The Council will not provide winter maintenance on private roads or prospective public roads.

Monifieth	8,370	69km	2/1		1	Grange Primary School Monifieth High School Seaview Primary School	373 1100 433			3	4		3		2		16
Montrose	11,880	107km	3/2	0		Borrowfield Primary School Lochside Primary School Montrose Academy Southesk Primary School St Margaret's Primary School	291 433 840 225 39	1		3 3 3			3	1	2		16

Score schools 1 under 100 pupils; 2 100-200; 3 200+; 4 for High school/Academy/College

Score retail 1 minor retail; 2 modest; 3 major

Score health care 1 pharmacy; 2 health centre; 3 hospital/minor injuries

Score topography 1 for inclines; 2 for hills

			significant footways - not treated			School														Applicable
Airlie			No significant footways - not treated		1	Airlie Primary School	37	6	1											Not Applicable
Murroes			No significant footways - not treated	0		Murroes Primary School	115	87	2											Not Applicable
Cortachy			No significant footways - not treated	0	1	Cortachy Primary School	32	18	1											Not Applicable
Arbirlot			No significant footways - not treated	0		Arbirlot Primary School	27	13	1											Not Applicable
Carmyllie			No significant footways - not treated	0		Carmyllie Primary School	27	16	1											Not Applicable
Eassie			No significant footways - not treated	0		Eassie Primary School	12	6	1											Not Applicable
Glen Isla			No significant footways - not treated	0		Isla Primary School	51	24	1											Not Applicable
Inverarity			No significant footways	0		Inverarity Primary School	49	20	1											Not Applicable

			- not treated																	
Stracathro			No significant footways - not treated	0			Stracathro Primary School	19	1	1										Not Applicable
Tealing			No significant footways - not treated	0			Tealing Primary School	49	21	1										Not Applicable

Score schools 1 under 100 pupils; 2 100-200; 3 200+; 4 for High school/Academy/College

Score retail 1 minor retail; 2 modest; 3 major

Score health care 1 pharmacy; 2 health centre; 3 hospital/minor injuries

Score topography 1 for inclines; 2 for hills

OPTIONS

The motion requires the revisions to be cost neutral within the agreed winter maintenance budget. The savings made for 2018/19 was £104k, with circa £50k for village treatment. Options for funding this from elsewhere in the service:

1 **Option 1 Remove carriageway treatments to fund footway treatment.**

A Service Review previously identified a saving to stop the weekend gritting of routes in the Glens. These routes are treated Monday to Friday on the basis of school transport, and without school transport are not considered priorities. Weekend treatment was introduced by the council circa 10 years ago. Under this option the budgeted costs of this treatment could be re-allocated to additional footway resources.

The total cost of this element of winter service is estimated at £110,000. To meet the current funding gap and reducing weekend routes to 2 would save approximately £70,000. The remaining routes treated would be B951 Glen Isla and the B955 Glen Clova; the routes removed being the C35, Glen Lethnot; C30 Nornside; Gleogil; C28 Glen Prosen; C28 Glen Prosen; B954 Glen Linthathen and the C36 Glen Esk.

Given the medium term budget forecast, it is anticipated that this proposal may have to form the savings from 2019 onwards and therefore substituting this service for footway service is not a sustainable option.

Given the comparable risks involved with vehicles traffic particularly on rural roads, compared to footway traffic and the practical aspects of securing additional mini-tractors which is unlikely to be able to be implemented by the start of the 2018/19 winter season and even if possible potentially at significantly higher costs, **this option is not recommended at this time, due to the operational challenges of procuring vehicles but may have to form part of further budget savings and reduction of winter service levels.**

2 **Option 2 Reduce spread rates/costs of materials**

The expression of 'spreading the jam thinner' is often used to reduce costs whilst maintaining a service. Reducing the amount of salt, which is literally spread on the footways or carriageways, has been considered. Salt spread rates have been developed through good practice and identified through the Code of Practice with minimum spread rates for salt to be effective in freezing conditions. Whilst there are isolated cases of mechanical issues where salt spread is inappropriate, overall the rates of spread are not an area that can be adjusted. Any reduction is likely to be ineffective and give a false sense of safety to pedestrians who use the footway, as well as being inefficient use of the associated labour and vehicles. **This option is not recommended as it is unsafe.**

3 **Option 3 Reduce the cost of vehicles**

Reducing costs by reducing the use of vehicles and utilising hand spreading or cheaper hand operated mechanical spreaders could provide a service in both the towns and re-instate an equitable service in the villages. However the lengths of footways treated would be substantially reduced. **This option is not recommended.**

4 **Option 4 Reallocate the remaining footway mini-tractors**

Reducing the number of mini-tractors serving the Burghs would enable resources to be reallocated to at least some of the villages depending on the number of mini-tractors relocated.

The reduction in mini-tractors agreed by council in Report 59/18 was from 16 to 10 for the burgh towns; and 4 to 0 available to treat in the villages. In physical terms this saw the loss of 1 or 2 gritters in the Burghs and one gritter in each of the villages as follows:

- Forfar and Sidlaw – four footway gritters reduced to two for Forfar only; no footway gritters will be available for Sidlaw;
- Kirriemuir – two footway gritters reduced to one;
- Montrose – three footway gritters reduced to two; no footway gritters will be available for Ferryden or Hillside
- Brechin and Edzell – two footway gritters reduced to one for Brechin only; no footway gritters will be available for Edzell;
- Arbroath & Friockheim, Letham and Wellbank – five footway gritters reduced to two for Arbroath only; no footway gritters will be available for Friockheim, Letham or Wellbank;
- Carnoustie – two footway gritters reduced to one; and
- Monifieth – two footway gritters reduced to one.

In considering redistributing the remaining mini-tractors the following options have been considered:

- a) **Removing one of the remaining footway mini-tractors from Arbroath and creating a village route.** Given Arbroath is the largest town with the highest population in Angus, some 10 times that of any village with two secondary schools; seven primary schools; a Dundee and Angus College campus; infirmary and other health care; major retail area split over High St

area and West Port area; various minor retail areas; and topography, despite being a coastal area Arbroath cannot be adequately treated with only one mini- tractor. **This option is not recommended.**

- b) Removing one of the remaining footway mini-tractors from Forfar and creating a village route.** With the spread across the town of the secondary school; three primaries, and Whitehills Hospital, as well as the retail areas, it is not feasible to treat all these routes with one mini-tractor. It is feasible to treat the major routes, restricting the available routes to school with 2 mini-tractors but reducing the route of the second vehicle allows it to be utilised for additional routes in a village. This latter alternative is a possible option when combined with other similar alternatives. **This option is not recommended.**
- c) Removing one of the remaining footway mini-tractors from Montrose and creating a village route.** With the spread across the town of the secondary school; three primaries, and health care, as well as the retail areas, it is not feasible to treat all these routes with one mini-tractor. It is feasible to treat the major routes, restricting the available routes to school with 2 mini-tractors but reducing the route of the both vehicles allows it to be utilised for additional routes in a village. This latter alternative is a possible option when combined with other similar alternatives. **This option is not recommended.**
- d) Share mini-tractor between Monifieth and Carnoustie.** Undertaking routes in Carnoustie before moving the mini-tractor to Monifieth, or doing this in reverse, would not deliver footway treatment to the respective secondary schools and primary schools, health care etc before 9 am. **This option is not recommended.**
- e) Reduce footway treatment routes in Monifieth and divert mini-tractor to Muirhead/Birkhill and Wellbank.** Further reductions in the route in Monifieth create capacity for resources to treat some footways in Muirhead/Birkhill and Wellbank as an alternative possible option when combined with other similar alternatives.
- f) Reduce footway treatment routes in Brechin and divert mini-tractor to Edzell and Friockheim.** Further reductions in the route in Brechin create capacity for resources to treat some footways in Edzell and Friockheim as an alternative possible option when combined with other similar alternatives.
- g) Reduce footway treatment routes in Forfar and divert mini-tractor to Letham.** A further reduction in the routes in Forfar creates capacity for resources to treat some footways in Letham as an alternative possible option when combined with other similar alternatives.
- h) Reduce footway treatment routes in Montrose and divert mini-tractors to Hillside and Ferryden.** Further reductions in the routes in Montrose create capacity for to treat some footways in Hillside and Ferryden as an alternative possible option when combined with other similar alternatives.

Combining options 4e) to h) it is feasible to treat the following:

- Reduced routes in Forfar treated by 2 mini-tractors; with one mini-tractor moving to Letham to treat limited routes to school and Square, completion probably after 9 a.m.
- Reduced routes in Brechin treated by 1 mini-tractor; which then moves to Edzell to treat the High Street; and then move Friockheim to treat Gardyne Street from shops, pharmacy to school and Westgate, completion probably after 9 a.m.
- Reduced routes in Monifieth treated by 1 mini-tractor; which then moves to Muirhead/Birkhill treating Coupar Angus Road including retail, pharmacy and Dronley Road for school before moving to Wellbank to treat from shop to school, completion probably after 9 a.m.
- Reduced routes in Montrose treated by 2 mini-tractors; with one mini-tractor moving to Hillside to treat Main Road and Hospital Road for school and retail; with one mini-tractor moving to Ferryden to treat Burnside Place/West Terrace, Craig Road for school completion probably after 9 a.m.

The routes treated in the villages; as per the routes treated in the towns, are significantly reduced from previous years. On completion of the village routes all mini tractors would return to the Burgh towns to continue to treat non-priority routes if necessary due to weather.

If snow/black ice affects routes, the routes take longer to complete treatment in the villages will be delayed including due to extended travel time between sites.

The above arrangements give equity in terms of allocating resources to areas based on the council's previous priorities for treating schools, health care and retail.

Of the villages that were previously treated as a priority it has not been feasible to include Glamis, Newtyle, Newbigging or Monikie. These villages scored 2 or less than 3 in the assessment against the council priority areas to treat.

Similarly those villages that would previously have received non-priority treatment (scoring 2 or less) cannot be treated.

- 5 **Option 5 Retain proposals set out in Report 59/18** – the review considers the option of not changing the proposals set out in Report 59/18 given the rationale behind reducing the service levels to “...use the resources available for winter maintenance in the most efficient, effective and economic way ...” and “...gives priority to the more important and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network (both carriageways and footways)”.

Under this option community engagement and provision of resources to assist communities self help would be encouraged as per Report 229/18 Schedule 3

OPTIONS APPRAISAL

The feasible options are 4e) to h) and 5 and are considered in the table below against the principles of the motion and the other objectives

	Option - Combined 4e) to h)	Option 5	Comment
Equitable policy of pavement gritting between our borough towns and villages	Provides a further reduced service in the 7 Burghs and the 7 highest priority villages	Provides a reduced service in the 7 Burghs	As far as practically possibly with 10 mini-tractors
Within the existing budget and cost neutral.	Yes	Yes	
Efficient, effective and economic	No	Yes	Mini tractors require travel /loading/unloading – for Option 4; Option 5 is efficient use of resources
Gives priority to the more important and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network	No	Yes	Option 5 is focussed on the areas of higher population/busiest schools/retail/health care areas

SUGGESTED REVISED POLICY

If Members are minded to adopt Option 4 (e to h) in Appendix 5, a suggested revised policy is presented for Members' consideration and approval.

**ANGUS COUNCIL
WINTER SERVICE 2018/2019 POLICY**

Angus Council will endeavour to use the resources available for winter maintenance in the most equitable and efficient, effective and economic way to prevent, as far as is considered reasonably practicable, snow and ice endangering the safe passage of pedestrians and vehicles over public roads and to minimise the inaccessibility of public roads and temporary disruption of traffic directly attributable to adverse weather conditions.

The Council will therefore operate a system of winter maintenance which shares resources whilst giving priority to the more important and heavily trafficked sections of the public road network (both carriageways and footways) in each of the main settlements across the council area as far as practically possible.

The Council will encourage the use of self-help measures, including community-led provision of some local winter services.

The Council will not provide winter maintenance on private roads or prospective public roads.

TREATMENT ROUTES

If Members were to adopt Option 4 (e to h), this Appendix lists the footways that could be treated in the towns and villages; and also notes those footways that would no longer be treated in the Burgh towns under this option.

PROPOSED PRIORITY FOOTWAYS - MONDAY TO FRIDAY –Revised to suit option of using mini-tractors from Brechin; Forfar; Monifieth; and Montrose

Roads shown in strikethrough text are those footways that will no longer be treated compared to Report 229/18 Schedule 3 to allow footway treatment in the villages which shown in bold. Other routes were deleted as a result of the reduction from 20 to 10 footway mini-tractors.

ARBROATH

Abbey Street	Ernest Street	Lochlands Street
Abbey Park	Fisheracre	Lochlands Drive
Abbey Path	Grant Road	Lordburn
Abbot Street (part)	Gravesend	Market Place
Applegate	Guthrie Port	Mayfield Shops
Academy Street	Hamilton Green	Millgate
Addison Place	Hume Street	Millgate Loan
Allan Street	Hayshead Road	Montrose Road
Arbirlot Road	Hays Lane	Ponderlaw
Arbirlot Road West	Hays Terrace	Ponderlaw Lane
Bakers Wynd	Hayswell Road	Rosemount Road
Barbers Croft	Helen Street	Seaton Road
Barngreen	Hill Place	Spink Street
Brechin Road	Hill Street	Springfield Terrace
Brothock Bridge	Hill Terrace	Stanley Street
Burnside Drive (part)	High Street	St Abbs Road
Cairnie Road	Horologe Hill	St Ninians Road
Cairnie Street	Keptie Street	Timmergreens shops
Catherine Street	Keptie Road	Viewfield Road
Charles Avenue	Kirk Square	Warddykes Avenue (part)
Commerce Street	Kirkton Road (part)	Walker Place
Culloden Terrace	Ladyloan	Wesley Gardens
Emislaw Drive	Leonard Street	West Abbey Street
East Abbey Street	Linton Road	West Port
East Kirkton Road	Link path to Inverbrothock	Westway
Elgin Place	School	

BRECHIN

Argyll St (East Side)	Gallowhill	Montrose Street
Church Street	High Street	Panmure Street
City Road	Infirmary Road	Southesk Street
Clerk Street (incl McGregor St)	Infirmary Street	St Davids Street
Commerce Street (Part)	Latch Road	St Mary Street
Distillery Road	Link Path to School (Strachans	St Ninians Square (Part)
Drumachlie Park (Part)	Park to	Trinity Road (part)
Duke Street	Drumachlie Loan (Part)	Swan Street
	Market Street	Union Street

~~Airlie Street;~~
~~Castle Street;~~
~~Drumachlie Loan (part)~~

~~Drumachlie Park (part)~~
~~St Ninians Square (part)~~
~~Trinity Road (part)~~

EDZELL

High Street

FRIOCKHEIM

Gardyne Street

Westgate

CARNOUSTIE

Anderson Street (part of)
Balmachie Road
Barry Road
Carlogie Road
Church Street
Dundee Street
Ferrier Street

High Street
James Street
Kinloch Street/Park
Lochty Street
Links Avenue
Maule Street
Newton Road

Queen Street
Ruxton Place
Shanwell Road
Station Road
Thomas Street
Victoria Street
West Path

FORFAR

Academy Street
Arbroath Road (Part)
Bankhead Road
Boyles Close
Brechin Road
Castle Street
Craig O'Loch Road
Coutties Wynd
Dundee Loan
Dundee Road (part of)
East High Street
Fyffe Street

Glamis Road (Part)
Kirriemuir Road (part of)
Lowson Avenue
Lentlands Road (Part)
Market Street
Myre Road (part)
New Road
North Street
Prior Road
Queenswell Road
Robertson Terrace
Service Road

South St (Part)
St James Road
Station Road
Taranty Road (part)
Taranty Place
Taylor Street (Part)
The Cross
West High Street
Whitehills School - Footway to
prior Rd

~~Glamis Road (Part)~~
~~Lentlands Road (Part)~~
~~Montrose Road~~

~~Fyfe St + path + Service Rd~~

LETHAM

Auldbar Road (Part)
Dundee Road (Part)
East Blairs Road (Part)
East Hemming St – The Square
Gardyne St (Part)

KIRRIEMUIR

Bank Close
Bank Street
Bellies Brae
Brechin Road
Clova Road
Crofthead
Cumberland Close
Glamis Road (part of)
Glengate (part of)
Gordon Park

High Street
Isla Road
Jamieson Close
Kirkton Court
Knothead
Lesser Roods
Lindsay Street
Manse Close
Ogilvy's Close
Prosen Road

Reform Street
Rogers Close
Roods
School Wynd
Shielhill Road
Sidlaw Range
St Malcolm's Wynd
St Colme's Close
Tannage Brae
Whiteside

MONIFIETH

Albert Street (Maule
Street to Hill Street)
Church Street
East Navarre Street
Ferry Road
Grange Road
High Street

Hill Street
Lorne Street (Hill Street to
High Street)
Maule Street
North Union Street
Panmure Street (part)
Panmurefield Road

Reform Street (High
Street to Brook Street)
South Street
Union Street
Victoria Street
West Grange Road
(Part)

~~Brook Street (Tay Street
to Reform Street)~~
~~North Balmossie Street~~

~~Tay Street (High Street to
Brook Street)~~
~~Victoria Street~~

MUIRHEAD AND BIRKHILL

Coupar Angus Road (Part)

Liff Road (Part)
Dronley Road

WELLBANK

Kellas Road (Part)
Mattocks Road
School Road

MONTROSE

Basin View – cycle track
to Medicinewell Park
Brechin Road
Bridge Street
Castle Place
George Street (part)
High Street
Hill Street

Hill Place
Hume Street
Lower Hall Street
Medicine Well Drive –
Cycle Path
Murray Street
Newhame Road
New Wynd

Northesk Road
Provost Scotts Road
(Part)
Panmure Place
Victoria Bridge
Western Road
Western Road North
(Part)
Wharf Street

~~Baltic Street~~
~~John Street Kincardine~~
~~Street~~
~~Market Street~~

~~Upper Hall Street~~
~~Western Road North~~
~~(Part)~~

HILLSIDE

Hospital Road (Part)
Main Road (Part)

FERRYDEN

Burnside Place
Craig Crescent
Craig Road (Part)
Ogilvie Terrace
South Esk Place
West Terrace