

Appendix B – Scoring of Options Against Assessment Criteria

Option 1 – Do Nothing / Status quo

	Criteria	Score	Reasoning	Weighting	Weighted Score
1	Supports the Councils strategic priorities for the Angus economy	1	Golf tourism would continue and may remain quite successful in the short term but decline in the medium term	30	30
2	Secures Carnoustie as an Open venue	0	Fails to address key issues so very high risk over medium term that this objective could be met	20	0
3	Secures continued access for local golfers	3	Scored 3 rather than 4 because may affect cost / availability for season ticket holders	20	60
4	Secures continued funding for charitable purposes	2	No change may mean less funds available	20	40
5	Ensures golf courses remain public assets	4	Represents no change	20	80
6	Ease of implementation	4	Represents no change	10	40
7	Speed of implementation	4	Represents no change	10	40
8	Overall level of risk	0	Pursuing this option carries significant risks	20	0
9	Potential commercial return for Council from these strategic assets	1	Existing arrangements would continue but not possible to go beyond this	10	10
	Total Score				300

Option 2 – New Governance Arrangements with External Investment - CGLMC Proposals

	Criteria	Score	Reasoning	Weighting	Weighted Score
1	Supports the Councils strategic priorities for the Angus economy	4	Expected to secure long term benefits associated with golf/leisure tourism	30	120
2	Secures Carnoustie as an Open venue	4	This is a primary objective of this option	20	80
3	Secures continued access for local golfers	4	This is a non-negotiable part of the proposals	20	80
4	Secures continued funding for charitable purposes	3	This is a non-negotiable part of the proposals but remains some uncertainty about how this would be achieved and values involved	20	60
5	Ensures golf courses remain public assets	2	Council would remain owner of the land, have a long-term lease and remain on the Board of Trustees for residual CGLMC activities.	20	40
6	Ease of implementation	3	Significant work done to date. A lot of work still to do but this option is well advanced	10	30
7	Speed of implementation	2	Significant work done to date. A lot of work still to do but this option is well advanced	10	20
8	Overall level of risk	2	Still a number of issues to be clarified and points to be negotiated so remains some risk to delivery overall	20	40
9	Potential commercial return for Council from these strategic assets	2	Long term lease provides opportunity for Council to receive some direct financial benefit but this has to be negotiated	10	20
	Total Score				490

Option 3 – New Delivery Model Led and Funded by Angus Council

	Criteria	Score	Reasoning	Weighting	Weighted Score
1	Supports the Council's strategic priorities for the Angus economy	3	Should secure long term benefits associated with golf/leisure tourism but more challenging to deliver this option from current position	30	90
2	Secures Carnoustie as an Open venue	3	This is a primary objective of this option but it would take longer to implement which carries risk to achievement	20	60
3	Secures continued access for local golfers	4	This is a non-negotiable part of the proposals	20	80
4	Secures continued funding for charitable purposes	4	This is a non-negotiable part of the proposals.	20	80
5	Ensures golf courses remain public assets	4	Depending on structure of model Council would retain large degree of control for the long term	20	80
6	Ease of implementation	1	This option has not been developed to any significant degree at this stage and would require further detailed investigation	10	10
7	Speed of implementation	1	As a less well developed option at this point this option would likely take longer to implement	10	10
8	Overall level of risk	1	This option carries a number of risks both on its own and its potential impact on Options 2 & 4	20	20
9	Potential commercial return for Council from these strategic assets	3	Potential for Council to make more significant return than under other options – Council would need to take on more risk to achieve this though. Council would need to buy in experience to deliver this option	10	30
	Total Score				460

Option 4 – CGLMC Proposals but on Different Terms

	Criteria	Score	Reasoning	Weighting	Weighted Score
1	Supports the Councils strategic priorities for the Angus economy	4	Expected to secure long term benefits associated with golf/leisure tourism	30	120
2	Secures Carnoustie as an Open venue	4	This is a primary objective of this option	20	80
3	Secures continued access for local golfers	4	This is a non-negotiable part of the proposals	20	80
4	Secures continued funding for charitable purposes	3	This is a non-negotiable part of the proposals but remains some uncertainty about how this would be achieved and values involved	20	60
5	Ensures golf courses remain public assets	3	Council would remain owner and terms of lease / potential Council input at Board level as shareholder is positive relative to Option 2	20	60
6	Ease of implementation	2	Significant work done to date on main elements of this model but no discussion to date on different terms.	10	20
7	Speed of implementation	2	Significant work done to date on main elements of this model but no discussion to date on different terms	10	20
8	Overall level of risk	1	Still a number of issues to be clarified and points to be negotiated so remains some risk to delivery overall. More risk to achievement than Option 2	20	20
9	Potential commercial return for Council from these strategic assets	3	Long term lease provides opportunity for Council to receive some financial benefit but this has to be negotiated	10	30
	Total Score				490

Option 5 – Seek a Shorter Term Solution

	Criteria	Score	Reasoning	Weighting	Weighted Score
1	Supports the Council's strategic priorities for the Angus economy	1	Golf tourism would continue and may remain quite successful in the short term but decline in the medium term. Score reflects lack of certainty this option is deliverable	30	30
2	Secures Carnoustie as an Open venue	2	Score assumes a short term solution can be achieved but recognises the short term nature of this	20	40
3	Secures continued access for local golfers	3	Scored 3 rather than 4 because may affect cost / availability for season ticket holders	20	60
4	Secures continued funding for charitable purposes	2	No change over the longer term may mean less funds available	20	40
5	Ensures golf courses remain public assets	4	Represents no change	20	80
6	Ease of implementation	3	Will require additional work and discussion to achieve	10	30
7	Speed of implementation	3	Assumed to be less time consuming to reach agreement assuming partners are willing to discuss	10	30
8	Overall level of risk	1	Pursuing this option carries a high level of risk now and for the longer term	20	20
9	Potential commercial return for Council from these strategic assets	1	Existing arrangements would continue but not possible under current arrangements to go beyond this	10	10
	Total Score				340