

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Alison Milne

Address: 24 Hospitalfield Gardens Arbroath DD11 2LW

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Disappointed that more green space is to be used when there are areas within town boundary screaming for development. Eg Seaforth hotel, metal box factory and Ernest Street. Implications for traffic flow and school capacity are also worrying. Arbroath will become a series of residential suburbs with nothing at its heart.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Angus Moyse

Address: 15 Timbergreens Arbroath DD11 2JA

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment:Objection to the proposed development on road safety grounds.

This development on the south side of Arbirlot Road West, when complete, will consist of 640+ properties.

A further development on the north side of the road, combined with the ongoing development on East Muirlands Road will add traffic to a road already busy with HGVs serving the farms, agricultural vehicles and household traffic.

The local authority has conceded there are problems with traffic congestion at the junction of Arbirlot Road West and Timbergreens Cottages and have erected signs re traffic restrictions.

A full review into road safety and traffic management should be conducted before permission is granted.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: carla stather

Address: 23 Hospitalfield Road Arbroath DD112LP

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment:Objection to this development based on the drastic impact it will have on the local school. The current development at East Muirlands once finished is more than likely to take the school to full capacity even before this new development has begun. Not only this, but the new houses at Bloomfield and the development of vacant flats in the area can only have further drastic consequences for the school. How can the school possibly accomodate all these new developements?

The Traffic on Arbirlot Road West is another concern of mine. The new development at east muirlands has made an already busy road even busier especially around school hours, posing a huge risk to the safety of young children in the area. Adding in another development can only bring significant problems.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Lord Lukas Matal

Address: 18 elmfield avenue Arbroath DD11 4hb

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Will take local primary school places at murfield over capacity  
no proper regular public transport links to town

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Alan Hunter](#)  
**Cc:** [Vivien Smith](#); [Ruari Kelly](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Crudie Farm application - Documentation/Process error.  
**Date:** 09 November 2021 11:43:48

---

Hi Alan,

I have been checking and my comment has never appeared, not to sure what happened. Please find my main comments below if they can be uploaded?

Please find my written objection against the proposed development site at Crudie Farm.

### **Education**

This development will have a drastic impact on the quality of education for the children of Muirfield Primary School. During construction they will be subject to years of noise and dust impact. (15+ years if all phases go ahead.....an entire school life dealing with construction impact). Once into operational phase they will be subject to noise issues as noted by Environmental Health Report, and then crucially they will be greatly impacted by capacity at their school approaching and then rapidly exceeding maximum capacity. The associated impact on their individual education is therefore unquantifiable.

Following my intervention, the number of schoolchildren generated by the proposed phase 1 development was retrospectively increased in the documentation from 8 in primary school to 33.58 in primary school and 7 in secondary school to 29.8 in secondary school. Quite a ridiculous error against such an important topic.

It is a concern members of the public have to correct this, as it makes you question what else has been missed and also it means that concerned parties have read the incorrect information and have used this as part of their information in support, objection or no comment.

The document states that phase 1 projected children therefore does not exceed primary school capacity, however when you consider that this development opens the floodgates for a further 4 phases as is the intention, it makes it apparent what the ultimate impact would be. As depicted below, Phase 3,4 and 5 would take the number of schoolchildren generated well past the capacity of the existing, recently upgraded school.

	Children	Capacity	Situation
Current	242	335	Acceptable
Phase 1	275	335	Acceptable
Phase 2	308	335	Acceptable
Phase 3	341	335	Out-with
Phase 4	374	335	Out-with
Phase 5	407	335	Out-with

**\*Does not include East Muirlands new development figures**

Further, the document and application seem to have not taken any cognizance of the number of schoolchildren that will be generated from the on-going East Muirlands Road development, which seems short sighted as this will only have a further significant impact on the children of this area's quality of education.

Can the application assess the number of schoolchildren who will be generated by the East Muirlands development and consider it in line with this one? I note the impact on education document is missing from the East Muirlands application therefore it is not possible to analyse myself. At 287 houses at East Muirlands Road, crude numbers would suggest 60+ primary children, meaning phase 1 Crudie Farm could actually be taking the school close to maximum capacity.....

The development brief states "the site capitalises on the renewal and extension of Muirfield Primary School", how can that possibly be when you scratch under the surface of the facts, I am surprised this marketing line has been allowed to be printed and would ask for a more holistic review to be undertaken, rather than looking at 1 phase without considering wider and crucial context, never mind adjacent developments.

I also note a concern from environmental health regarding noise, not only during construction but also due to heat pumps in the operational phase....As phase 1 is directly beside a school and neighbouring properties, the collective noise impact of this huge development is therefore of significant concern. Environmental health comments on this is based on the first phase.....the impact of 5 phases is going to be vast for the school and associated parties.

Dust will also be a significant factor coming off of these developments, with numerous reports from recent Scotia builds that houses in close proximity have to keep all windows closed....how will the local school manage to do this with current and on-going covid guidance regarding ventilation.

#### **Traffic -**

-

Traffic on Arbirlot Road West has for several years now been a concern, with the local authority taking steps to deal with it. With cars parking all along the road it becomes a single lane where you can wait behind parked cars for some time. School mornings are also a major issue in the area, with parking wardens and traffic police in regular attendance. We will now have hundreds of commuters joining the road around school time.... It poses a huge risk to the safety of young children in the area.

-

#### **Wildlife & Archaeology –**

Geese currently use Crudie Farm field as a migration point. I also note the concerns in the archaeology report and hope these are considered carefully.

**Mark Gilmartin**

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr Adam Stewart

Address: 40 Kinghorne Street Arbroath DD11 2LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Alongside many other comments, I have concerns with the increased pressure and capacity limit of Muirfield Primary School, especially with the ever growing estate at East Muirlands Road, and the expected upgrading of houses at Arbirlot Road.

There is also the concern of flooding/drainage to the existing properties with the Hospitalfield residence.

There will also be an increase of traffic to and from the school in an already congested area of Hospitalfield, and creating an increased risk to the residents of the area.

I feel it is important to keep arable land in place to the benefit of the migratory pink footed geese that are deemed as an amber species under the Birds of Conservation Concern review.

I feel there is no need for these houses to be built when, as I have stated before, there are houses in East Muirlands which are still being built and to be filled, Arbirlot Road which will have new houses, the new house being built at the old Emislaw Drive Playground, further building at the Stewart Milne site (Meadowbank), the housing estate at Cliffburn etc, especially as there are a significant lack of businesses opening and operating within the town. There are surely more important areas that can be developed before this one, for example the Old Box Factory next to the Elliot Caravan Park. Without jobs, these houses will remain empty, and until sufficient plans to introduce long term employment opportunities are put in place, another housing development is the least of Abroath's problems.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr Bob Turner

Address: 68 Kinghorne Street ARBROATH DD11 2LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: There are many reasons why this is an insufficient siting for the new build homes apart from spoiling views from existing homes.

1. The drainage would be a major impact as flooding is already an issue, can it be guaranteed that the planned facilities of soakaways will be effective and not cause issues to current properties.
2. The new Muirfield school which is not built big enough to accommodate all the new houses and other developments in the area.
3. The traffic that this will generate especially more large machinery and lorries, can surrounding roads facilitate?
4. The amount of work these new households/areas will generate for Angus Council services will have a massive impact on an already stretched facility.
5. The local wildlife that reside in these fields and also the geese that migrate there every year.
6. Under current restrictions all schools require to have their windows open, how will this impact Muirfield with a building site next door.
7. Noise pollution will also impact school children.
8. There are many empty areas/sites in Arbroath that should be exhausted before all our green belt is utilised as an easy/cheap option.



# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr Callum McNee

Address: 32 Kinghorne Street Arbroath DD11 2LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Object

1. We have concerns regarding flooding/drainage to the existing properties of Hospitalfield.
2. There will be increased pressure put on the capacity of Muirfield Primary School (there are still families moving into houses at East Muirlands Road)
3. There will also be an increase of traffic to and from the school in an already congested area of Hospitalfield, creating an increased risk to the residents of the area.
4. I feel it is important to keep arable land in place to the benefit of the migratory pink footed geese that are deemed as an amber species under the Birds of Conservation Concern review.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr Dale Kidd

Address: 48 Railton Gardens Arbroath DD11 3FA

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I think this new development will be great to expand Arbroath and offer some new housing opportunities

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr David Butler

Address: 8 Hospitalfield Gardens Arbroath DD11 2LW

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Miscellaneous

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Main reason for objection is the pressure this development would put on Muirfield Primary School as the school is still to see the full impact on the school roll from the unfinished East Muirlands Development.

Phase 1 of this proposed scheme has 61 4-bed properties and 65 3-bed properties - to suggest that these 126 properties would only generate 33.58 primary school places appears a massive underestimation.

Granting permission for Phase 1 of a 5 phase development would clearly exceed the school roll rendering a brand new purpose build school unfit for purpose.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr Esslemont Alan

Address: 30 Hospitalfield Gardens Arbroath DD112LW

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Do not agree with proposed development

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr james dear

Address: 77 patrick allan fraser street Arbroath dd112lx

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment:there is a need for quality low rent houses in Arbroath, would be better if the housing was council owned and managed, feel its a good site for housing ,but would make a good mix of council and private owned housing

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mr Mark Brown

Address: 48 Kinghorne St Arbroath DD112LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: We have great concern at the proposed size of this development.

Development is still ongoing in East Muirlands road, with many houses still to be completed, as well as planned development on Arbirlot Road West.

Further development will greatly impact what is already becoming a congested road system.

Muirfield primary school will be expected to cope with the East Muirlands development, new housing on Arbirlot Road West as well as this proposal, can it realistically cope with this influx ?

Also concerned with the potential for flood, with runoff from the proposed estate on a downward slope towards the existing Hospitalfield estate.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mrs Ailsa McNee

Address: 32 Kinghorne Street Arbroath DD11 2LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Object

1. We have concerns regarding flooding/drainage to the existing properties of Hospitalfield.
2. There will be increased pressure put on the capacity of Muirfield Primary School (there are still families moving into houses at East Muirlands Road)
3. There will also be an increase of traffic to and from the school in an already congested area of Hospitalfield, creating an increased risk to the residents of the area.
4. I feel it is important to keep arable land in place to the benefit of the migratory pink footed geese that are deemed as an amber species under the Birds of Conservation Concern review.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mrs Emma Turner

Address: 68 Kinghorne Street Arbroath DD11 2LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Impact on Muirfield Primary School. New families are still moving into East Muirlands Road site and new houses recently erected at Bloomfield Park site, already greatly increasing school capacity. Are more Angus Council houses planned for this area with the demolition of the flats on Arbirlot Road West and the West Way? If so there catchment school is Muirfield!

Increase in traffic on an already very busy road.

Flood / drainage concerns for existing properties.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mrs Jill Brandie

Address: 71 Arbirlot Road West Arbroath DD112JE

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Firstly there's the school which is only 2 years old, would need to be rebuilt to make it double the size as it's already over occupied and that's before the new houses on East Muirland Road are finished! The road on Arbirlot Road West is already busy with some cars travelling at high speed which I don't find a safe environment for my children, building new houses would just make it worse!

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mrs Sarah Tas

Address: Not Available

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Too congested.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mrs Tracy Mann

Address: 46 Kinghorne Street Arbroath DD11 2LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Concerned at the flooding/drainage that will come from the development of this land.

Migrating geese and other wildlife that will be disturbed, why are we using arable land?

Muirfield school is newly built and with the already growing scheme on East Muirlands Road and Bloomfield Place, and the development of the flats that are presently vacant, the school roll will be increasing greatly. How can another housing scheme in the Muirfield catchment area be considered without thought going into the schools ability to accommodate, potentially, a large number of families moving into these houses?

The traffic on Arbirlot Road West is already quite significant, adding another housing scheme can only bring significant problems and potentially cause harm to the school children that use that exit from school.

Given that the Persimmon homes at East Muirlands Road have yet to be completed, I find it naive to consider the building of another housing estate before this is complete. You are unable to confirm any impact on traffic or the school capacity whilst this is incomplete.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Mrs Watson Gillian

Address: 30 Kinghorne Street Arbroath DD112LZ

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Miscellaneous

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: We are concerned about flooding to existing houses in Hospitalfield due to the layout of the site and the flood planes.

The building of houses on this field will also interrupt the yearly migration of geese which gather in this field before they migrate .

Muirfield Primary will also struggle to cope with the increased numbers of children and the roads leading to the school will become even busier.

# Comments for Planning Application 21/00749/FULM

## Application Summary

Application Number: 21/00749/FULM

Address: Land At Crudie Farm Arbirlot Road West Arbroath

Proposal: Proposed residential development of 146 dwellinghouses with associated infrastructure including vehicular access, landscaping, drainage, SUDS and open space

Case Officer: Ruari Kelly

## Customer Details

Name: Ms karen smith

Address: 1 school road Arbroath DD112LU

## Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: The amount of housing in this proposal is far too high the road structure is not there to cope with the additional traffic Muirfield school would be overwhelmed, not enough amenities in the town to accommodate so many people i.e no more gp surgeries dentists are being planned to accommodate all these new patients green space is also being used up instead of brown sites in the town.