

APPENDIX F TO REPORT NO 42/23

OPTIONS APPRAISAL OF RECYCLING CENTRES

Senior Accountable Officer	Graeme Dailly, Director of Infrastructure and Environment
Project lead	Susanne Austin, Team Leader – Waste Strategy and Compliance

Contents

1.0	Background.....	1
2.0	Reason for the Review ('case for change').....	1
3.0	Scope of the Review.....	1
4.0	Defining the Objectives.....	2
5.0	The options	2
6.0	Information Gathering.....	2
7.0	Options Appraisal	4
8.0	Summary and preferred options	6

1.0 Background

It was agreed at the meeting of Angus Council on 6 September 2018 (Report 264/18) to change the provision of recycling centres in Angus. The table below summarises the arrangement that has been in place since 4 February 2019.

Recycling Centre	Materials accepted	Opening
Arbroath	Non-recyclable (general) waste and recycling	7 days per week
Brechin	Recycling only	5 days per week
Carnoustie	Recycling only	5 days per week
Forfar	Non-recyclable (general) waste and recycling	7 days per week
Kirriemuir	Recycling only	5 days per week
Monifieth	Recycling only	5 days per week
Montrose	Non-recyclable (general) waste and recycling	7 days per week

2.0 Reason for the Review ('case for change')

A further review of recycling centres has been undertaken for the following reasons.

- It is projected that over £50m of revenue budget savings will be needed over the next 3 years. Delivering further savings from the way recycling centres are provided is considered essential to address the budget gap.
- Agreement was reached with Dundee City Council (DCC) for Angus residents in the Monifieth and Sidlaw ward to use DCC's Baldovie and Riverside recycling centres from 1 February 2022. This formed part of the agreement to extend the life of the former DERL waste to energy facility at Baldovie, Dundee and is expected to last 6 to 9 years.
- We now have data on how our recycling centres are being used following the changes made in February 2019 i.e. number of visitors and total tonnes of waste collected.

3.0 Scope of the Review

This review will consider the continued opening of each of the 4 smaller recycling centres that currently only accept recyclable items.

The 3 larger recycling centres that currently accept non-recyclable and recyclable waste are considered essential. The current staffing levels at these centres are also considered essential to safely manage traffic, use machinery on site and maximise recycling (and in turn reduce waste disposal costs).

The current opening days/times at the recycling centres are considered appropriate. Any reduction in hours would cause more traffic congestion at the sites and would only deliver a relatively minor saving.

4.0 Defining the Objectives

The appraisal will assess each of the options against the following objectives:

1. To deliver as significant a financial saving as possible.
2. To maximise the amount of waste collected for recycling or reuse.
3. To provide convenient access to a recycling centre for communities.
4. To minimise the carbon impact from additional travel.

Each objective will be scored between -3 (significantly negative impact); 0 (neutral impact); +3 (significantly positive impact). For the objectives which are qualitative the scoring is compared across the options and graded according to the scale of the impact. For the quantitative data the impacts are graded by the scale of the revenue, capital and carbon impacts.

Significant negative impact	Moderate negative impact	Low negative impact	Neutral impact	Low positive impact	Moderate positive impact	Significant positive impact
-3	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	+3

The scores against the objectives are weighted on the following basis. The higher weight for objective 1 reflects the urgent requirement to deliver financial savings.

Objective 1 – financial savings = 4 (40%)

Objective 2 – recycling and reuse = 2 (20%)

Objective 3 – convenience for communities = 2 (20%)

Objective 4 – carbon impact from travel = 2 (20%)

5.0 The options

The following options are being considered as part of this appraisal.

1. Closure of Brechin Recycling Centre
2. Closure of Carnoustie Recycling Centre
3. Closure of Kirriemuir Recycling Centre
- 4a. Closure of Monifieth Recycling Centre
- 4b. Closure of Monifieth Recycling Centre and acceptance of non-recyclable (general) waste at Carnoustie Recycling Centre

Option 4b has been included in recognition that the acceptance of non-recyclable waste disposal at Carnoustie could mitigate impacts of closing Monifieth Recycling Centre.

6.0 Information Gathering

6.1 Budget breakdown

The table below provides a breakdown of the 2021/22 budget for the recycling centres under review.

	Salaries	Property costs	Supplies & services	SEPA Licences	Land access	Total
Brechin	22,749	14,477	2,411	2,493	0	42,130
Carnoustie	22,749	18,003	2,411	4,123	0	47,286
Kirriemuir	22,749	17,258	2,411	4,123	0	46,541
Monifieth	22,749	17,505	2,411	4,123	25,000 ¹	71,788
Total	413,469	268,869	21,035	31,918	25,000	760,291

¹ A payment is made to the MoD for access through their Barry Buddon camp (avoiding low rail bridges) to service skips.

6.2 Volume of waste (tonnes) collected at each recycling centre

The table below shows the total waste and recycling collected from each Recycling Centre during 2021/22. The centres have been placed in highest to lowest order by tonnes collected. This highlights the significant difference between the centres and that Kirriemuir collects a low volume of waste relative to the other centres.

Recycling Centre	Tonnes (1 April 2021 to 31 March 2022)		
	Non-recycling	Recycling	Total
Arbroath	3,083	4,365	7,448
Forfar	1,910	2,949	4,858
Montrose	1,537	2,475	4,012
Carnoustie	n/a	798	798
Monifieth	n/a	486	486
Brechin	n/a	469	469
Kirriemuir	n/a	250	250

The table below shows the effective cost per tonne of waste/recycling collected at each of the recycling centres under review based on costs shown in 6.1. This excludes disposal costs.

Recycling Centre	Effective cost per tonne collected
Brechin	£90
Carnoustie	£59
Kirriemuir	£186
Monifieth	£148

6.3 Visitor numbers to each centre

The table below shows the number of vehicles visiting each Recycling Centre between October and December 2022. A new traffic counter system was installed at the centres during September 2022. The previous counters at centres were not functioning properly so there is no reliable data prior to this.

The centres have been placed in highest to lowest order by number of vehicles recorded. This shows the significant difference between the three largest centres and the rest and highlights that Brechin and Kirriemuir are the least visited (there is no data available for Carnoustie but given the volume of waste collected is far greater at Carnoustie it is assumed there are more visitors at Carnoustie). It should be noted that the number of visitors will be higher in the summer months when more garden waste is generated.

	October	November	December	Total
Arbroath	9,731	5,986	10,462	26,179
Forfar	6,668	8,194	9,886	24,748
Montrose	5,222	5,447	6,332	17,001
Carnoustie	<i>Unavailable due to fault with counter system</i>			
Monifieth	876	1039	622	2,537
Brechin	567	668	612	1,847
Kirriemuir	636	514	374	1,524

6.4 Travel distances to the larger recycling centres

The table below shows the travel distance and time to the nearest recycling centre(s) for each of the four centres under review. This is the distance from recycling centre to recycling centre.

	Arbroath	Forfar	Montrose	Baldovie	Carnoustie
	Travel distance (miles) and estimated time by car (minutes)				
Brechin		13 (17 mins)	8 (14 mins)		
Carnoustie	8 (14 mins)				
Kirriemuir		6 (11 mins)			
Monifieth	12 (18 mins)			5 (12 mins)	5 (11 mins)

There are no significant differences, but Monifieth and Kirriemuir have the least travel distance and time to the next nearest recycling centre.

6.5 Community consultation

There has been no community consultation exercise carried out on the basis our decision making is primarily driven by the objective to deliver financial savings and there would be limited opportunity for the community to influence the final decision. However, convenient access for communities has been included as an objective and has been considered as part of the options appraisal.

7.0 Options Appraisal

Option 1 - Closure of Brechin Recycling Centre

Objective	Weighting (A)	Score (B)	Weighted score (A x B)
1. Financial savings	4	+2	8
2. Recycling and reuse	2	0	0
3. Convenience for communities	2	-2	-4
4. Carbon impact from travel	2	-1	-2
Total			2

- Estimated saving = £42,000
- No significant impact on recycling rate. Residents would access the same range of recycling containers at Montrose or Forfar Recycling Centre.
- Distance from Brechin to Montrose Recycling Centre is 8 miles and estimated travel time by car is 14 minutes. This is a longer distance than Kirriemuir or Monifieth to their next nearest recycling centre.
- Residents already need to travel to Montrose/Forfar to dispose of non-recyclable items.
- There would be less skip lorry movements as all waste in skips would be mechanically compacted at Montrose or Forfar recycling centre (this does not happen at smaller RCs). There would however be more private vehicle mileage. This could be mitigated by encouraging multi-purpose journeys to neighbouring towns.
- On balance, it is assessed that the carbon impact if negative would be minor. It was not considered viable to commission a more detailed study on the net carbon impact.
- There would be a potential capital receipt from sale of the land.

Option 2 - Closure of Carnoustie Recycling Centre

Objective	Weighting	Score	Weighted score
1. Financial savings	4	+2	8
2. Recycling and reuse	2	0	0
3. Convenience for communities	2	-2	-4
4. Carbon impact from travel	2	-1	-2
Total			2

- Estimated saving = £47,000
- No significant impact on recycling rate. Residents would access the same range of recycling containers at Arbroath Recycling Centre.
- Distance from Carnoustie to Arbroath Recycling Centre is 8 miles and estimated travel time by car is 14 minutes. This is a longer distance than Kirriemuir or Monifieth to their next nearest recycling centre.
- Residents already need to travel to Arbroath to dispose of non-recyclable items.
- There would be less skip lorry movements as all waste in skips would be mechanically compacted at Montrose or Forfar recycling centre (this does not happen at smaller RCs). There would however be more private vehicle mileage. This could be mitigated by encouraging multi-purpose journeys to neighbouring towns.
- On balance, it is assessed that the carbon impact if negative would be minor. It was not considered viable to commission a more detailed study on the net carbon impact.

- There would be no potential capital receipt from sale of the land as forms part of the existing operations depot and access through is required.

Option 3 - Closure of Kirriemuir Recycling Centre

Objective	Weighting	Score	Weighted score
1. Financial savings	4	+2	8
2. Recycling and reuse	2	0	0
3. Convenience for communities	2	-1	-2
4. Carbon impact from travel	2	-1	-2
Total			4

- Estimated saving = £47,000
- No significant impact on recycling rate. Residents would access the same range of recycling containers at Forfar Recycling Centre.
- Distance from Kirriemuir to Forfar Recycling Centre is 6 miles and estimated travel time by car is 11 minutes. Residents already need to travel to Forfar to dispose of non-recyclable items.
- There would be less skip lorry movements as all waste in skips would be mechanically compacted at Montrose or Forfar recycling centre. There would however be more private vehicle mileage. This could be mitigated by encouraging multi-purpose journeys to neighbouring towns.
- On balance, it is assessed that the carbon impact if negative would be minor. It was not considered viable to commission a more detailed study on the net carbon impact.
- There would be a potential capital receipt from sale of the land.

Option 4a - Closure of Monifieth Recycling Centre

Objective	Weighting	Score	Weighted score
1. Financial savings	4	+3	12
2. Recycling and reuse	2	0	0
3. Convenience for communities	2	-1	-2
4. Carbon impact from travel	2	-1	-2
Total			8

- Estimated saving = £72,000
- No significant impact on recycling rate.
- Distance from Monifieth to Baldovie Recycling Centre is 5 miles and estimated travel time by car is 12 minutes. Residents already need to travel to Baldovie to dispose of non-recyclable items.
- There would be less skip lorry mileage as there would no longer be the need to divert through the MoD camp to access the recycling centre. There would however be more private vehicle mileage. This could be mitigated by encouraging multi-purpose journeys to neighbouring towns.
- On balance, it is assessed that the carbon impact if negative would be minor. It was not considered viable to commission a more detailed study on the net carbon impact.
- There would be a potential capital receipt from sale of the land.

Option 4b - Closure of Monifieth Recycling Centre and acceptance of non-recyclable (general) waste at Carnoustie Recycling Centre

Objective	Weighting	Score	Weighted score
1. Financial savings	4	+2	8
2. Recycling and reuse	2	0	0
3. Convenience for communities	2	0	0
4. Carbon impact from travel	2	0	0
Total			8

- Estimated saving = £49,000
- Assumes Carnoustie would retain current opening hours and staff will transfer from Monifieth to Carnoustie Recycling Centre. This would avoid any redundancies. It is considered this would provide sufficient staff resource at Carnoustie.
- No significant impact on recycling rate.

- There would no longer be a recycling centre in Monifieth but local residents would now have two options for disposal of non-recyclable waste nearby (Baldovie and Carnoustie).
- The access to the Baldovie Recycling Centre is subject to an agreement with DCC that will expire and no guarantee that will be renewed. This will ensure there will be nearby access.
- There would be less travel for residents in the Carnoustie area as they would no longer need to travel to Arbroath for non-recyclable items. This option was therefore scored as neutral in terms of convenience and carbon impact.
- It is considered possible to fit all required recycling containers plus a non-recyclable waste skip at the existing Carnoustie site. There is the option to expand Carnoustie Recycling Centre into the adjoining Parks depot. This would improve layout, reduce congestion and provide scope for more recycling but would require capital funding.
- There would be a potential capital receipt from sale of the land at Monifieth that could potentially be used towards the expansion of the Carnoustie site.

8.0 Summary and preferred options

Option	Weighted score	Estimated Saving
1. Closure of Brechin Recycling Centre	2	£42,000
2. Closure of Carnoustie Recycling Centre	2	£47,000
3. Closure of Kirriemuir Recycling Centre	4	£47,000
4a. Closure of Monifieth Recycling Centre	8	£72,000
4b. Closure of Monifieth Recycling Centre and acceptance of non-recyclable waste at Carnoustie Recycling Centre	8	£49,000

Option 4b is considered the preferred option as it has the joint highest weighted score and for the following key reasons.

- The running costs of Monifieth Recycling Centre are high relative to the volume of waste collected and number of vehicles visiting. This is exacerbated by the requirement to pay for vehicular access through the MoD Barry Buddon camp.
- An agreement has been established with DCC for Angus residents to use the Baldovie Recycling Centre only 5 miles away in Dundee, although this may be time limited.
- The return of a non-recyclable waste skip to Carnoustie would provide further choice for Monifieth residents and increase convenience for Carnoustie residents.
- There would be no requirement for staff redundancies as Monifieth based staff would transfer to Carnoustie.
- There is the potential of a capital receipt from the sale of land at Monifieth Recycling Centre.

If there is a requirement to deliver further savings, options 1 (closure of Kirriemuir Recycling centre) and 3 (closure Brechin Recycling Centre) should also be considered. Both have negative impacts in terms of convenience for local communities, but information gathered shows that the costs of running these facilities are high relative to the volume of waste collected and number of vehicles visiting.

Option 3 (closure of Kirriemuir Recycling centre) would be preferred over Option 1 (closure Brechin Recycling Centre) for the following reasons.

- The volume of waste collected at Kirriemuir shows that it is used far less than other Centres. 250 tonnes of waste/recycling collected at Kirriemuir per year compared with 469 tonnes at Brechin.
- The effective cost per tonne of waste/recycling collected at Kirriemuir is estimated to be £186 compared with £90 for Brechin.
- The distance to from Kirriemuir to Forfar Recycling Centre (6 miles) is closer than the distance from Brechin to Montrose Recycling Centre (8 miles). This is from Centre to Centre and for some villages it is recognised the distance is further.