

ANGUS COUNCIL

COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE – 1 OCTOBER 2024

SCHOOL FRIENDLY ZONES AT ANGUS PRIMARY SCHOOLS PHASE 2 AND 3 UPDATE

REPORT BY GRAEME DAILLY, DIRECTOR OF INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENVIRONMENT

1. ABSTRACT

This Report relates to the progress to date and the determination of permanent Traffic Regulation Orders in respect of the School Friendly Zones at nine primary schools in Angus.

2. ALIGNMENT TO THE COUNCIL PLAN AND COUNCIL POLICIES

This Report contributes to the achievement of our priorities in our Council Plan for 2023 – 2028.

Caring for our Place

- Enable inclusive, empowered, resilient and safe communities across Angus.
- Make our local services accessible.
- Improve connectivity in and around Angus.
- We will take action to mitigate against climate change by delivering our Transition to Net Zero Action Plan: 2022 to 2030.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Committee -

- (i) notes the progress made in respect of School Friendly Zones as detailed in this report as provided for under Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders;
- (ii) approves the making of a permanent Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Andover Primary School, Brechin;
- (iii) approves the making of a permanent Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Carlogie Primary School, Carnoustie;
- (iv) approves the making of a permanent Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Letham Primary School;
- (v) approves the making of a permanent Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Liff Primary School;
- (vi) approves the removal of the Experimental Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Southesk Primary School, Montrose;
- (vii) approves the removal of the Experimental Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the additional School Friendly Zone at Muirfield Primary School, Arbroath;
- (viii) approves the making of a permanent Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Maisondieu Primary School, Brechin;

- (ix) approves the removal of the Experimental Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Seaview Primary School, Monifieth; and
- (x) approves the removal of the Experimental Traffic Regulation Order in respect of the School Friendly Zone at Newtyle Primary School.

4. BACKGROUND

- 4.1 As noted in Report No. 45/21 elected members, local residents and other members of the public have historically regularly raised a number of concerns over matters arising from vehicles dropping off or picking up school children on the roads serving primary schools. These include concerns relating to restricted visibility at junctions, restricted access to premises, general congestion and congestion at or near the school entrances.
- 4.2 Previous measures to manage vehicle traffic around schools has included School Keep Clear Zig-Zag markings; parking restrictions and part time 20mph speed limits which have helped to address some of these concerns and go some way to managing driver behaviour around schools.
- 4.3 The introduction of School Friendly Zones (with variations on the nomenclature) has been piloted nationwide by various local authorities over recent years, including neighbouring Tayside authorities. School Friendly Zones expand the above (para 4.2) options, helping to create safer, more pleasant environments to encourage active travel to school. School Friendly Zones are considered an effective measure to help encourage active lifestyles, increase walking and cycling journeys, reduce car trips and improve road safety outside schools during peak periods: due to less motor vehicle movements in the road or roads covered by the zones. If successful, the measures can also lead, in the long term, to a number of child health benefits.
- 4.4 The rationale behind the initiative is that the road network outside the school gate or in the surrounding streets will be closed to vehicular traffic at specific times, except for those vehicles permitted to be there. This includes residents, local businesses, Blue Badge holders and other permitted vehicles, such as emergency services, school contract buses, and roads and utility companies undertaking emergency works. A permit system allows authorised vehicles to access/egress the restricted area.
- 4.5 School Friendly Zones are not suitable for all roads serving our school estate sites. Schools with gates onto main roads that serve as bus or emergency service routes would not be considered. This is due to the impact of diverting high volumes of traffic through adjacent residential streets creating additional safety issues. This reduces the number of suitable sites to school entrances on routes with no, or limited, through traffic.
- 4.6 In general, the restricted zones should be appropriate to the road environment and, therefore, self-enforcing to the driver leading to a situation where little or no formal enforcement is required. However, it is accepted that certain drivers will disregard good practice and some enforcement activity by Police Scotland and, through DPE (Decriminalised Parking Enforcement), by the Council's Community Enforcement Wardens may be necessary. As part of our partnership working, Angus Council works closely with Police Scotland when considering any possible changes to the road network and the sites have been reviewed with them, and Police Scotland were part of the stakeholder groups.
- 4.7 The initiative is supported by a number of organisations including Living Streets and Sustrans and form part of the Draft Tactran Regional Transport Strategy 2024-2034 (Action 16 "Tactran and the Councils will promote active and sustainable access to schools includes school exclusion Zones"). Furthermore, the measures have the potential to support priorities in the Council Plan where modal shift to active travel is encouraged, as well as being an action from the Road Safety Member/Officer Group action plan referred to in Report 48/22.

5. CURRENT POSITION

Implementation

- 5.1 Further to the initial discussions at the Road Safety Member/Officer Group various requests or suggestions for School Friendly Zones have been assessed by Council Roads officers. Specific proposals at selected sites were then developed in consultation with a dedicated Stakeholder's Group for each school, made up of Police Scotland, local Councillors, Community Councils, school staff, members of the relevant Parent Council/Teacher's Association and Angus Council officers from Roads & Transportation and Education and Lifelong Learning. There has been a phased approach to implementation of School Friendly Zones and to date the following schools have been trialled:

Phase	School	Date of Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (Reference to previous Committee decisions/reports)	Previous Committee decisions(reports)
1	Ferryden Primary School, Montrose; Langlands Primary School, Forfar; Muirfield Primary School, Arbroath.	7 June 2021 (Report No. 45/41)	All Phase 1 sites made permanent (Report No. 386/22)
2	Andover Primary School, Brechin; Carlogie Primary School, Carnoustie; Letham Primary School; Liff Primary School; Southesk Primary School, Montrose.	16 August 2022 (Report No. 49/22)	Subject of this report
3	Muirfield Primary School*, Arbroath; Maisondieu Primary School, Brechin; Seaview Primary School, Monifieth; Newtyle Primary School.	15 August 2023 (Report No. 152/23)	Subject of this report

* The Muirfield Primary School proposal in Report No 152/23 is for the access from School Road and is in addition to the School Friendly Zone, which was made permanent via Report No. 386/22 that serves the access from Timmergreens.

- 5.2 As per the table above the School Friendly Zones trialled in Phase 1 were made permanent by Communities Committee in November 2022. The Committee are now asked to consider the next steps for those School Friendly Zones trialled in Phase 2 and 3.
- 5.3 The trial of the School Friendly Zones, as agreed through Report Nos 49/22 and 152/23 were implemented as approved under Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders (ETROs), prohibiting vehicular traffic during specified time periods during the day and during school terms only.
- 5.4 ETROs differ from Permanent Traffic Orders, in the legal process that they are implemented.
- ETROs can come into force after 7 days of noticing – this allows for swift use of such orders where there is a demonstrable need and demand.
 - ETROs have a consultation period which is open to objections for a minimum period of six-months from the day the order comes into force.
 - Within the six-month initial period, which can be extended to a maximum of 18 months (following which the Scottish Minister can grant extensions by application), any variations or modifications made to the ETRO, e.g. changes in restrictions and directions, would reset the six-month 'clock' for objections.
 - Where there are no objections within the assigned six-month period or such objections are removed, the ETRO can become permanent. This could therefore be after six months and a day.

- Where an objection(s) remains and is not removed, the decision to make permanent would be made by committee following consideration of the objection(s) to that ETRO.

In comparison, Permanent Traffic Orders are subject to a shorter consultation period of not less than 21 days (Notice of Proposals), followed by any remaining objections being subject to a Committee decision, and thereafter, if agreed, the Orders can be made, thereafter coming into effect and physical works implemented.

- 5.5 In addition to the requisite advertising and noticing of the Orders, the Council's Communications team published details of the proposed trials on social media.
- 5.6 The extent and times of the Orders are as detailed in Report Nos 49/22 and 152/23 and align to the agreed proposals from the stakeholders' meetings for each school and allow for pre and post school clubs where appropriate. Waiting and loading restrictions were also included in the Orders where it was identified that displaced vehicles would park at inappropriate locations that could result in road safety issues.
- 5.7 Locations were identified for parents/carers to park and drop off/pick up the children away from schools. The surrounding road network was deemed suitable for this purpose where the vehicles were dispersed over a wider area than was previously experienced on the roads fronting the schools.
- 5.8 The commencement date for the ETROs was 16 August 2022 for Phase 2. Objections and representations received are detailed in **Appendices 1 to 9**.
- 5.9 Modifications were made to the waiting restrictions at Carlogie Primary School to prevent displaced vehicles from blocking driveways in Chapman Drive and Craigmill Gardens.
- 5.10 A further Temporary Traffic Regulation Order (TTRO) was made to allow further time for evaluation of the experimental measures at the Phase 2 sites. The TTRO came into effect on 19 February 2024.
- 5.11 The commencement date for the ETROs was 15 August 2023 for Phase 3.
- 5.12 Modifications were made to the waiting restrictions at Muirfield Primary School to provide protection and better visibility of the School Crossing Patroller on Hospitalfield Road.

Evaluation

- 5.13 Report Nos 49/22 set out the method for evaluation of the trial zones, using "before" and "after" surveys. These were to include:
 - Air pollution samples taken at the school gates
 - Road traffic accidents
 - Traffic flows
 - Active travel uptake
 - Public perception i.e., support for the proposals or otherwise; support for or objection to the experimental order
- 5.14 Report No 152/23 expanded on the previous evaluation detail stating that the success of the trial, for the Phase 3 zones, would be measured through:
 - A reduction in traffic congestion and speed around school gates as measured through before and after traffic speeds and volume surveys
 - An increase in walking and cycling and reduction in car trips as measured through the annual Sustrans Hands Up survey and WOW Travel Tracker
 - An improvement in air quality at the school gates
 - Consultation with stakeholders as measured through attitude surveys.
- 5.15 Previous Report No 49/22 stated that the data gathered was to be analysed to assess the success or otherwise at each site with a report then submitted to the Communities Committee to recommend either the retention or the removal of the restrictions at the respective sites. This

Report seeks the Committee's decision on Phases 2 and 3 based on the expanded criteria set out in Report Nos. 49/22 and 152/23

- 5.16 The evaluation of each of the nine individual sites is set out in **Appendices 1 to 9**.
- 5.17 In considering air quality issues, SEPA has previously recommended that emissions sensor data should only be used as a marker of trends. SEPA advises full analysis of sensor data relating to school traffic would reap very little benefit, as the sensors do not collect any weather data that would be required for any detailed air quality analysis. SEPA does not recommend comparing one day with another because of the effects the weather has on dispersion, particularly from local sources such as school traffic, and the potential impacts from regional sources, such as regional/national pollution events. SEPA recommends that consideration is only had of visual data to demonstrate the 'potential' from local traffic sources when they are talking to schools or about school traffic. It is recommended that further analysis is not the best way of assessing data relating to school traffic because the prohibitions of traffic are over such a short time period. Therefore, raw sensor data may not be of much use, and it is better to extract a few days' worth of visual data with the right trends which is normally the best SEPA can expect to achieve.
- Air quality samples were taken at the school gates before and after the implementation date of the ETROs. From the available data, higher peaks can be seen in the afternoon periods which may be attributed to times parents or carers tend to wait to pick up children with their car engines running, whereas emissions levels are usually more spread out in the morning and in most cases 'drop-off' is less prone to engine idling over longer time spans.
- 5.18 Regrettably, due to technical issues, the comparable air quality recordings for Andover, Carlogie, and Southesk schools could not be provided by SEPA prior to the writing of the report.
- 5.19 No road traffic accidents were reported before or after implementation of the Phase 2 and Phase 3 ETROs.
- 5.20 In addition to enforcing the waiting and loading restrictions under DPE powers, the council's Community Enforcement Wardens have attended all sites as part of their regular decriminalised parking enforcement (DPE) patrols supporting the implementation of the zones and giving advice to residents, parents and drivers. This has included patrolling restrictions within the bounds of the school exclusion zones such as, double yellow lines, school zig zag markings and bus stops.
- 5.21 As indicated earlier in paragraph 4.6, moving road traffic offences are enforced by Police Scotland and the waiting and loading restrictions are enforced by the council's Community Enforcement Wardens. Community Enforcement Wardens have no legal powers to interfere in road Policing matters but have provided the appropriate advice to support drivers where such offences have been witnessed.

6. PROPOSALS

- 6.1 The Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders and Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders covering the School Friendly Zones are time limited, and due to expire commencing in February 2025, if not extended.
- 6.2 The details of objections and representation responses to each ETRO are set out in **Appendices 1 to 9** where appropriate.
- 6.3 The evaluation, as per the methodology previously agreed by Committee, is set out individually for each site in **Appendices 1 to 9**.
- 6.4 The Committee are asked to either make the Orders for the School Friendly Zones permanent or to instruct the Director of Infrastructure and Environment to remove the School Friendly Zones.
- 6.5 Based on the evaluation in **Appendices 1 to 9**, taking into account the factual information available for each site, the officer recommendations, for Committee's consideration are set out in Section 3 of this report.

- 6.6 Where Committee makes the decision to remove School Friendly Zones, the infrastructure will be removed as soon as practically possible post the Committee. The vehicle permits will no longer be required, and the traffic arrangements will return to the pre-Experimental Traffic Regulation Order status. Any of the temporary waiting and loading restrictions which were included in the ETROs, which Committee agree to be removed, will be discussed with local members to consider for retention through a future permanent Traffic Regulation Order if there is merit in doing so.

7. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 7.1 Advertising for the making of a permanent TRO for the school friendly zones will incur additional costs of approximately £750 + VAT.
- 7.2 The costs of removing the infrastructure, however, should the proposals be deemed unsuccessful, are estimated at £1,000 per school, potentially totalling £9,000.
- 7.3 Based on the recommendations the costs are estimated at £3,750. The costs can be funded from the 2024/25 Capital – Traffic Calming/Road Safety budget.

8. RISK MANAGEMENT

There are no risk management implication arising from the recommendations of this report.

9. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no direct environmental implications arising from the recommendations of this report beyond those referred to in 5.17 and 5.18 above.

10. EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT, HUMAN RIGHTS AND FAIRER SCOTLAND DUTY

An Equality Impact Assessment has been carried out and is attached in **Appendix 10**.

11. CHILDRENS RIGHTS AND WELLBEING IMPACT ASSESSMENT

A Childrens Rights and Wellbeing Impact Assessment has been carried out within the EIA.

12. CONSULTATION

The Chief Executive, Director of Legal, Governance & Change, Director of Finance, and Director of Education & Lifelong Learning have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

NOTE: The background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) which were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above report are:

- Report No. 167/19 – Roads Safety Plan to 2020 – Update, Communities Committee 28 May 2019.
- Report No. 45/21 – Experimental Traffic Order for School Exclusion Zones, Communities Committee, 23 February 2021
- Report No. 48/22 – Road Safety Framework to 2030 Update, Communities Committee, 22 February 2022
- Report No. 49/22 – School Exclusion Zones at Ferryden Primary School, Montrose; Langlands Primary School, Forfar; And Muirfield Primary School, Montrose, Communities Committee, 22 February 2022

- Report No. 386/22 – School Friendly Zones at Muirfield Primary School, Arbroath; Ferryden Primary School, Montrose and Langlands Primary School, Forfar. The Angus Council (School Friendly Zones) (Traffic Management) Order 202x, Communities Committee – 22 November 2022
- Report No. 152/23 - Experimental Traffic Regulation Order for School Friendly Zones - Phase 3, Communities Committee – 23 May 2023

REPORT AUTHOR: Graeme Dailly, Director of Infrastructure & Environment

EMAIL DETAILS: Communities@angus.gov.uk

List of Appendices:

Appendix 1 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone at Andover Primary School, Brechin
 Appendix 2 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone Carlogie Primary School, Carnoustie
 Appendix 3 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone Letham Primary School, Letham
 Appendix 4 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone Liff Primary School, Liff
 Appendix 5 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone Southesk Primary School, Montrose
 Appendix 6 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone at Muirfield Primary School, Arbroath
 Appendix 7 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone at Maisondieu Primary School, Brechin
 Appendix 8 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone at Seaview Primary School, Monifieth
 Appendix 9 – Evaluation of School Friendly Zone at Newtyle Primary School
 Appendix 10 - Equalities Impact Assessment